33 (2022) 20-69

ignaziana
rivista di ricerca teologica

The Ignatian Spiritual Exercises and non-Christian traditions

by Jacques Scheuer S.J.*

Foreword

In the following pages the reader will find an attempt to gather information and elements of reflection about the relationship between the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola and non-Christian spiritual traditions. This area may be considered as a small corner in the field of history of religions or comparative religion and also in the more practical field of interreligious relations and of inculturation of this particular Christian tradition in non-Christian cultural and spiritual contexts. The debates about sharing the practice of the Spiritual Exercises with members of other religions are also taken into account.

On the other hand, studies and essays concerned more broadly with Ignatian spirituality and non-Christian traditions are usually not included, even if the borderline may sometimes be less than obvious. More general studies and essays about Eastern ways of meditation or contemplation, such as Yoga and Zen, compared or contrasted with Christian faith or spirituality are not taken into consideration, even when penned by well-known Jesuit authors.

It will appear that most of the entries refer to Hinduism and Buddhism, more specifically to the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ* and to Zen. But other Asian traditions are mentioned when relevant. A few entries are concerned with Islam and a couple more with Judaism and with African traditions. The 'Western' world (Europe and the Americas) is beyond the scope of this survey. To the best of my knowledge, writings by non-Christians about the Spiritual Exercises are very few.

The documentation presented here is divided into two complementary parts. The first section offers a presentation of about twenty more significant and innovative or more extended and detailed contributions. The second section is a bibliography listed in alphabetical order of the authors; brief annotations and a short index to a few selected themes are provided.

This tentative and provisional bibliography is certainly not exhaustive. Very short and/or unsubstantial items have been left out. I have unfortunately not been able to include publications in Asian (Japanese, Vietnamese, Tamil…) or African languages. Translations of the same item in several languages have usually not been listed. Additions and corrections will be gratefully received.

* Jacques Scheuer S.J., Professor (retired) of Indian and Far Eastern Religions at the Université Catholique de Louvain (Louvain-la-Neuve); lecturer at the Centre Sèvres (Paris). *jacques.scheuer@uclouvain.be*

1. Reading notes

A Bunch of Historical Jottings

The practice of the Spiritual Exercises in the mission fields, particularly in Asia, is rather poorly documented. It is not our intention here to venture on an investigation of this practice from the sixteenth century on. About a dozen studies are mentioned in the bibliography below. Let us be satisfied here with a couple of instances showing some connection with the cultures and spiritual traditions of India and the Far East.

Jesuit missionaries of course used to set apart a full week for a yearly retreat based on the Ignatian Exercises. But, according to Fr. Léon Besse in his booklet on the practice of the SpEx in the ancient "Mission du Maduré", in South-East India, retreats were being preached according to the Ignatian Exercises to groups of Catholic lay people. He found a first (and rather late) mention of such retreats in a letter addressed in 1719 to Fr. General by Fr. Charles-Michel Bertoldi. It seems that the small number of the missionaries, the rather poor education of many converts as well as the frequent bouts of famine and local wars had hampered for a long time the organization of such group retreats. [see BESSE 1910]

In another booklet published in the same series, Fr. Hosten reports a rather curious development. When preaching popular retreats in Brittany in the 17th century, Fr. Vincent Huby used to display symbolic images depicting the moral or immoral dispositions of the heart or the soul. These came to be used by Protestants as well and adapted to German or Dutch audiences. Later, in the 19th century, "in the Indies, the Protestants acquired a sort of monopoly on Huby's *Miroir du Cœur*... They translated it or had it translated into a number of native languages and in some of them it went through several printings". Fr. Hosten provides bibliographical notices about translations in no less than seventeen Indian languages! [see HOSTEN 1911]

A more ancient and rather well documented practice comes to us from seventeenth-century China. The Western Christian tradition of meditation or contemplation on Gospel scenes plays a central role in the Ignatian Exercises. It was soon transmitted, among other mission fields, to China. Chinese literati who had learned from Italian Jesuit Giulio Aleni (1582-1649) the art of prayerful consideration of the mysteries of Jesus' life were finding precious help in the illustrations of a famous book published on the initiative of Jerome Nadal: *Adnotationes et meditationes in evangelia* (Antwerp 1595) and by later Chinese reprints and adaptations. The reception and prayerful appropriation of these images and their commentaries was probably facilitated by the existence of comparable Buddhist and especially Daoist practices. [see STANDAERT 2015]

SpEx = Spiritual Exercises
BhG or *Gîtâ* = *Bhagavad-Gîtâ*

The Spiritual Exercises and Hinduism

Varghese MALPAN s.j., *A Comparative Study of the Bhagavad-Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola on the Process of Spiritual Liberation*, (= Documenta Missionalia 22), Rome, Editrice Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 1992, 442 p.

In this doctoral dissertation at the Gregorian University Institute of Spirituality (Rome), Varghese Malpan picks up an interesting red thread for his comparative analysis of the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ* [*BhG*] and the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises [SpEx]: he chooses to consider both texts as descriptive of processes of spiritual liberation. This dynamic perspective helps him to uncover and analyse parallels and similarities as well as contrasts. Obviously these two booklets – the short *BhG* should however be read and interpreted as but one section within the huge *Mahâbhârata* 'epic' – are vastly different in their literary style but they converge in their scope of leading into and guiding along a concrete spiritual itinerary. In both of them "the process of spiritual liberation is interwoven with the vision of *action*, the *consciousness* of God and his ways, and the experience of the *love* of God. The study therefore seeks to bring out the relationship and distinctness of this process in our sources." (24). Although both the *BhG* and the SpEx have of course been the subject of a vast number of enquiries, a close comparative study, to the best of the author's knowledge, was still missing.

The first two-thirds of the dissertation and of the published book provide a separate treatment of the text and, to some extent, the context of the *BhG* and of the SpEx. Even if the text of the *BhG*, as we now have it, remains the focus of the enquiry, it has to be examined against the background of the Vedic and Upanishadic literature. Whether composed by one or several authors during a shorter or longer span of time, the *BhG* lacks the tighter unity and internal coherence of the single-authored SpEx. The *Gîtâ* is an impressive attempt to synthesize the teachings and the terminologies of several spiritual and philosophical (especially Sâmkhya) traditions. The diversity of its sources of inspiration is manifest in the treatment of the teachings about God, the Self, and Nature or the world. In spite of the fact that these diverse contributions are marshalled at the service of a single spiritual and practical vision, it is no wonder that the *Gîtâ* teachings became across the centuries the object of diverging interpretations.

While sticking as much as possible to the text, V. Malpan intends above all to show how the process of spiritual liberation taps the resources of three distinct but complementary 'ways' (*mârga*): acts or action (*karma*), knowledge or wisdom (*jñâna*), and loving devotion (*bhakti*). "The author of the *Gîtâ* tries to combine and harmonise the Vedic and Upanishadic teachings into an original and unique synthesis which is a hymn of God's love for man and man's love for God. The nerve centre of this hitherto unheard of synthesis is to be traced in an integral vision of the three somewhat distinct but interdependent *yogas* (ways)" (97). As a process and as a goal, the '*Gîtâ-Yoga*' may be defined as "an act of self-integration which finds its threefold expression in action, knowledge and love, and which seeks its final fulfilment in union with the personal God" (101).

The second part of Malpan's dissertation offers a similarly detailed and thoughtful examination of the text of the SpEx. In this case however, our knowledge of the genesis

of the booklet benefits from what we know about the life and inner experience of its author. After a brief survey of the world-view of Ignatius (God, Man, the created World, Sin), the study focuses on the "dynamics of the process of spiritual liberation", the process of "deepening inner freedom aimed at decision making and/or reforming one's life for creative growth in Christ our Lord" (231). The structure of the four 'Weeks' "is not that of a linear continuity or development, but of spiral depth and growth" (232). The regular meditative practices of 'repetition' and 'application of the senses' here play a significant role. Particular attention is given to three 'Unitive Exercises': the Principle and Foundation, the Call of an Earthly King, and the Contemplation for attaining love.

In Parts One and Two, the *BhG* and the SpEx benefit from a detailed separate treatment. Readers are thus equipped with a rich baggage of information and analysis about the world-views and the development of both booklets. The last third of Malpan's study is dedicated to a formal and more explicit comparison: we move on from a 'latent' phase to an 'active' phase (335), pointing out "the elements of convergence and the underlying differences" (336), particularly in relation to God (immanence and transcendence, incarnation). Coming back to the "process of spiritual liberation" and the role of the three ways or disciplines of action, knowledge and loving devotion, the author offers valuable insights about 'yoga as equanimity' (*samatva*) and Ignatian 'indifference'.

However, rather than straightforward comparisons, we have here more than once Christian appreciations or evaluations of Hindu doctrines. We are shown more clearly what is 'lacking' on the *Gîtâ* side when compared with the SpEx. Fair enough. But the reader could have been warned that similar though obviously different 'lacks' could be pinpointed in the SpEx when compared with the *Gîtâ*. Some of the author's evaluations are well taken while others may seem a bit rash (and sometimes corrected or nuanced in other parts of this section), for instance when he declares: "In the *Gîtâ*, action as participation in God's own mission of saving the whole of humanity is conspicuous by its absence" (371). This is rather strange if one considers the *Gîtâ* teachings about the *avatâra*'s action for the restauration of the *dharma*, the right order and cohesion of the world (*lokasangraha*), as well as Arjuna's becoming an instrument in the hands of the Lord.

In spite of the overall valuable emphasis on the 'process of liberation', this Third and last Part of the dissertation may leave the reader with the impression of a rather static comparison. This is probably due above all to the different literary styles of our two sources. While the SpEx are built as a simple guide for the practice of the retreatant (and of the person who provides guidance), the *BhG*, while offering teachings and motivation for action, does not, in the present form of the text, provide a linear (or even a spiral) itinerary with equivalent clarity of design.

Having followed the author in his exploration of the *Gîtâ*, the Christian reader may feel that quite a number of its teachings, exhortations and suggestions could be relevant and helpful in a Christian process of spiritual liberation.

In a short conclusion, V. Malpan broaches the question of a possible integration in what he labels (after Xavier Irudayaraj's group? See IRUDAYARAJ) a "Indo-Ignatian" perspective. Is there a basis for such an integration? "Do the authors of the *Gîtâ* and the *Spiritual Exercises* speak... on their own authority, or do we have to look elsewhere for

ignaziana
rivista di ricerca teologica

an answer?" (403) Actually, the initiative belongs to God: the *Gîtâ* and the Exercises "can meet in the only one and true God who is the sole author of every religious experience... This meeting takes place at the horizon of 'unthematic' religious experience or 'common theologal' life since it is common to all theistic religions" (404). At this level, however, the integration "will, as we can very well presume, remain rather indistinct". Beyond this point, the author, as a Christian theologian, quite rightly states that attempts at (Christian) integration "should pass from the theocentric to the Trinitarian and Christocentric focus" (404): "Christ is the one Who integrates" (405). Such integrative enterprises belong however outside the span of the present dissertation.

Pavulraj MICHAEL s.j., *Search and Find the Will of God. A Dialogue between the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius and the Bhagavad Gîtâ* (estratto), Rome, 2012, ii-230 p.

About twenty years later, a similar comparative project was undertaken as a doctoral dissertation submitted to the same Institute of Spirituality at the Gregorian University. The red thread now is the search for the will of God. And 'comparison' is substituted by 'dialogue' or 'dialogical encounter'. Although this does not seem to actually make a lot of difference, the dialogue label makes clear the spirit and requirement of the endeavour: "openness to the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* with a willingness not only to speak but also to respond to what the text says" (187). If we compare with Malpan's work, much of the same ground is being covered although one might consider that searching and finding the will of God has a narrower focus than 'spiritual liberation'. 'Discernment' here will be at the centre of the stage; a definition is provided right from the start: it is a process or "a complex, multi-layered experience in which, intentionally, decision and action are interpreted in terms of movement toward or away from God" (1). An Indian and Hindu equivalent would be '*viveka*' or 'yogic consciousness' (6). Searching and finding the will of God will be considered throughout at the level of the "individual person" (9).

The comparative endeavour aims at clarifying similarities and differences as well as "identifying patterns of interrelation" between the SpEx and the *BhG* (7) and sometimes, more broadly, between Christianity and Hinduism: commentators and interpreters such as, on the Hindu side, Śankara and Râmânuja, Vivekânanda, Gandhi or Aurobindo are quoted quite frequently.

As might be expected, the dissertation is divided in three Parts. The first one, dedicated to the Spiritual Exercises, provides a detailed examination of the "Ignatian key meditations": Principle and Foundation, Kingdom of Christ, Two Standards, Three Classes of Men, Three Kinds of Humility, Contemplation for Attaining Love; it concludes with a chapter on the rules for the discernment of the spirits. On the *Gîtâ* side, three 'paths' or '*yoga*s' are considered in the perspective of searching and finding the will of the Lord: action (*karma*), knowledge (*jñâna*), and loving devotion (*bhakti*). A last chapter is devoted to the *Gîtâ* symbols of the chariot and the battlefield and their spiritual significance.

The Third and last Part provides the 'dialogue' between our two sources. Dedicated to particular themes, twelve short sections follow more or less the same pattern: separate and parallel surveys of the relevant matter drawn from the SpEx as well as from the

BhG, followed and concluded by comparative observations drawn and formulated from a Christian and Ignatian point of view. Let us pinpoint some more remarkable items.

Roughly, to begin with, the main steps in the process of discernment include: prayer, the "gathering of evidence" (reading the signs of the times) and the help of a guide, and "finding confirmation". Searching and finding the will of God obviously presupposes traditionally given representations and understandings of God (transcendence and immanence; Incarnation and *avatâra*) and of the human being (dual or triple constitution: spirit / soul / body). At times, however, it is difficult to make precise comparisons because Ignatius' anthropology is often closer to biblical and Pauline categories than to those of the Schoolmen while the *Gîtâ* does not exactly follow the strict dual categories of the Sâmkhya philosophical treatises.

Although grace plays no or little part in some Hindu schools, it is a significant dimension of the *Gîtâ* teachings. Another major point of convergence is finding or seeing God in all things and all things in God. Further on, P. Michael addresses the theme of "spiritual motions", particularly desolation and consolation, but the *Gîtâ* "procedures for the training of the mind" here adduced emphasize concentration and one-pointedness, self-control and motionlessness rather than interpretation of inner movements. Perhaps more relevant material might have been drawn from Arjuna's moods and queries in his interactions with Krishna, his charioteer, friend and guide. The next section is entitled "Controlling and Application of the Senses": the first exercise seems to be more present in the yoga of the *Gîtâ* while the second one is characteristic of the Ignatian booklet. Of course, the application of the senses, in spite of quite some uncertainties and debates about its exact nature and procedure, would likely find closer parallels in other Hindu traditions, for instance in later *bhakti* schools or in tantric movements.

The next two sections provide a rich material for parallel study and spiritual convergences: first, active indifference and desireless or selfless action (*nishkâma karma*); secondly, the spirit of contemplation in action and service compared with the *BhG* ideal of cooperation with the Lord for the welfare and harmonious maintenance of world and society (*loka-sangraha*). The last two sections are devoted to the themes of interior knowledge (*conocimiento interno / jñâna*) and love (*amor / paramabhakti*).

The printed *estratto* leaves the reader practically without conclusion (187-188) although the original dissertation had a twenty-page one. No attempt is made here to outline or even suggest ways of integrating *Gîtâ* materials and themes, let alone procedures, into the practice of the Exercises. We are left, prudently and perhaps wisely, with parallel expositions and the light these comparisons mutually throw on the understanding of both booklets. As we observed apropos Malpan's dissertation and book, this is partly due, no doubt, to the different literary styles of the SpEx and the *BhG*.

[May we be allowed here a short observation? Many modern authors – Gandhi would be a clear example – are prone to explain that the warlike scenario of the *Gîtâ* should be interpreted as an allegory of a purely internal or spiritual struggle. This may be due, on the Hindu side, to the rising importance of non-violence (*a-himsâ*) and to the devotional and even emotional colouring of *bhakti*. On the side of Christian interpreters of the *BhG*, particularly in comparisons with the Ignatian Exercises or other classics

of spirituality, there is also an emphasis on interiority and individual endeavour. The danger is to neglect the social and even cosmic dimensions of the *Gîtâ* understanding of *dharma*, especially when read in the broader context of the *Mahâbhârata* war. It is then somewhat ironical that some Western and/or Christian authors criticize Hindu spirituality for its lack of realism and of social or political relevance.]

Jacques SCHEUER s.j., "The Bhagavad Gîtâ as 'Spiritual Exercises'" in Catherine CORNILLE (ed.), *Song Divine. Christian Commentaries on the Bhagavad Gîtâ* (= Christian Commentaries on Non-Christian Sacred Texts 1), Leuven, Peeters / Dudley, Eerdmans, 2006, pp. 113-129.

Rather than a detailed comparison of teachings and worldviews, this short essay proposes to follow in a parallel way the development or sequence of the *Gîtâ* and the Exercises from the point of view of the person who 'receives' them (*SpEx* §§ 1; 5): Arjuna or the exercitant. The *BhG* is a dialogue aimed at helping prince Arjuna (and the reader as well) "to escape from the dilemma and distress where he is plunged, to grow step by step in the understanding of the meaning and import of his responsibility towards the society and the world, to perceive more clearly the various options open to him, in such a way that he becomes able to make a 'choice' or to achieve a 'discernment'" (115). Standing on the battlefield, Arjuna, a warrior and a prince, finds himself between the horns of a dilemma. His duty (*dharma*) is to fight and he is not a coward. But the prospect of the slaughter anguishes him and he discovers that *dharma* is complex and conflict ridden. Scruple, doubt and desolation assail him. The first chapter of the *Gîtâ* gives a long account of the movements of his soul.

The instructions and pieces of advice proffered by Krishna, the divine charioteer and trusted friend, do not follow a smooth, linear way. Nevertheless, the overall thrust may be interpreted as a process of internal transformation: "from haziness to bright light, from dispersion to inner unity, from lack of motivation to an engagement integrating the multiple dimensions of reality" (120). A knight's duty and mundane sense of honour will not do. Arjuna needs to be schooled in indifference or equanimity and non-attachment: "Yoga means 'sameness-and-indifference'" (*BhG* 2.48). Willpower will not do. Arjuna is invited to look at the Lord, the 'bountiful dispenser' (*Bhagavân*), the model and source of selfless action for the weal of the world, the model of untiring yogic activity: "Yoga is skill in works" (*BhG* 2.51).

We thus proceed from the consideration of an earthly king to the contemplation of the eternal king. And lo and behold! Krishna grants Arjuna a "divine eye" enabling him to contemplate the Lord in his cosmic dimension and glory. This manifestation may be considered as a consolation without any preceding cause or as an election in the 'first time', comparable to what happened to Paul on the road to Damascus (*SpEx* § 175). However, the fruit of such an experience has to be lived in one's daily routine. Arjuna learns to see everything in the Lord and the Lord's presence in everything. Several images and phrases resonate with the Contemplation for attaining love.

The personal link with Lord Krishna develops into an inclusive spirit of *bhakti*: more than 'devotion' (the usual translation), it means sharing and participation, a personal

bond based on loyalty, trust and affection: "Giving up all things of law (*dharma*!), turn to Me, your only refuge" (*BhG* 18.66). The disciple, an instrument in the hand of his Lord, is then able to act in a free and spontaneous way: "Ponder this wisdom in all its amplitude, then do whatever you will" (18.63). We are not far from "*ama et quod vis, fac*".

Francis X. CLOONEY s.j., "God for us. Multiple Religious Identities as a Human and Divine Prospect", in Catherine CORNILLE (ed.), *Many Mansions? Multiple Religious Belonging and Christian Identity*, Maryknoll, Orbis, 2002, pp. 44-60.

We remain here in the universe of *bhakti*, but with more affective and cultic overtones in both individual and collective devotion. A powerful *bhakti* current developed in the Tamil language area of South India. The supreme Lord – Śiva or, in this case, Vishnu Nârâyana – makes himself present in many ways: in ancient myths telling his salvific deeds for the sake of the world, in stories about his wonderful dealings with saints and devotees of past centuries, in his images everywhere in temples and pilgrimage sites, in practices of contemplative meditation and visualization. Both devotees and theologians never tire of celebrating the proximity of Nârâyana making himself accessible to simple but trustful devotion and praise. Under endless forms and guises, the Lord is near and accessible. He allows himself to be dependent upon the desires and imagination of each faithful:

Whichever form pleases his people, that it his form;
Whichever name pleases his people, that is his name;
Whichever way pleases his people who meditate without ceasing, that is his way.

Similarly, in the course of the Spiritual Exercises, particularly during the second, third and fourth Weeks, we find the "practice of applying the imagination to scenes from the life of Christ, composing such scenes so as to encourage the active engagement of the meditator" (52). In Preambles and Points suggested for daily prayer, the text of the *Exercises* provides concrete examples of such a practice. Now, the exercitant is not provided with ready-made images nor explanations "at great length" (*SpEx* § 2); he is rather invited to consider, observe and contemplate by himself (§§ 111-112, 114-116). Constructive, "personal engagement in the contemplative process is given maximum opportunity" (55). "Although the forms are understood as rooted in historical fact, Ignatius presumes that God is willing to accommodate the images generated by the person who contemplates the history now. The great energy behind imaginative practice in the *Exercises* is rooted in Ignatius's expectation that there can be an immediate relationship between God and the person who meditates, by way of the vehicle of the meditator's honest use of the imagination" (53).

In connection with the main topic of the volume where his contribution appears, Francis Clooney observes that nowadays not a few people, including exercitants, may find themselves at the crossroad of two or several religious traditions and imaginaries. "We ourselves begin to belong to those multiple traditions in new and complex ways. In a sense we are 'intertexted' in our spiritual practice" (57). But, "even when our imaginations have become religiously more complicated and diverse, it is still the same God who is seeking us out, accommodating us where we are" (59).

Ignatius PUTHIADAM s.j. & Martin KÄMPCHEN, *Geist der Wahrheit. Christliche Exerzitien im Dialog mit dem Hinduismus. Ein Lese- und Übungsbuch* (= Reihe Engagement), Kevelaer, Butzon & Bercker, 1980, 226 p.

In aim and structure, this older publication is vastly different. It is a self-help book containing all the necessary material for individuals intending to make an eight-day retreat in the spirit and according to the pattern of the Spiritual Exercises. It is more specifically adapted to Western (here German-speaking European) Christians. In the mind of Ignatius Puthiadam, its main author, exploring spiritual resources from Eastern religions, especially Hinduism, in a spirit of dialogue and in a prayerful and contemplative way, could help Christians renovate and deepen the understanding of their own faith as well. Provided they are ready to discover unfamiliar landscapes, not out of sheer curiosity but with the genuine desire to learn from authentic spiritual traditions, Christian retreatants might appropriate and integrate to their own life useful resources (teachings, methods and practices).

Like many others before, this book follows, in a shortened and simplified way, the structure and itinerary of the SpEx and their four 'Weeks': creation and Principle and Foundation, sin and conversion, following Christ according to the Gospels, presence of Christ in the eucharist and the sacraments, passion and resurrection, gift of the Holy Spirit to the Church and Contemplation *ad amorem*. The daily suggestions for reflection, meditation and contemplative prayer do not follow literally the Ignatian text but are adapted to the environment, culture and style of late twentieth-century simple believers.

The matter for each day is divided into three unequal sections. The first and more developed one usually starts with short anthropological reflections (f. i., what is the meaning of life?), followed by explicitly Christian themes; it ends with food for thought and prayer drawn from the Hindu heritage. This Hindu material is presented in an accessible way, without technicalities or academic preoccupations, but with the expertise of an author fully at home in Indian thought and spirituality. Besides biblical references, the brief second section usually provides three to four short texts taken from the Hindu Scriptures (Veda, Upanishad, *Bhagavad-Gîtâ*...) or later traditional authors (up to Vivekananda, Tagore and Gandhi); these quotations may be used for prayerful reflection.

The last section contains practical indications for each meditation period: bodily posture (sitting, lying, walking...), use of light or darkness, use of images, symbols and gestures, singing or prayerful repetition of divine Names (*nâma-japa*), fasting and concluding feast meal... For each day of the week, particular instructions are given about 'exercises' meant to foster concentration and peaceful awareness by way of mindful focusing on in- and outbreath, on the body, on sounds or sights etc. The body and the imagination play throughout a big part. From all this, it appears that the Indian and Hindu resources presented here are not restricted to doctrinal baggage but include a broad range of yogic exercises and devotional practices that may be helpful to Christian and other retreatants everywhere.

As it stands, this 'reading and practice' book is meant to provide everything a Christian needs for a full eight-day individual retreat, at home or elsewhere, although it may also be adapted for a group retreat. While the author states that the occasional help

from a spiritual guide or wise advisor is important, the permanent presence of such a person is clearly not mandatory.

Michael AMALADOSS s.j., *Iñigo in India. Reflections on the Ignatian Exercises by an Indian disciple*, Anand, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1992, xviii-120 p.

In the Introduction, the author clearly states what his little book is not. Twenty years earlier, he had been considering Christianity as the crown of Hinduism. As of 1991, 500th anniversary of the birth of Ignatius of Loyola, he considers himself as heir to two traditions, a situation and a process of 'interior dialogue' where the Christian and the Indian heritages meet in a creative and mutually enriching way. What the author intends in these pages is not a scholarly, 'objective' comparison, not two separate expositions followed by a comparative study: "This is a process of development, not comparison. A comparison may have been useful at a certain stage. But now that stage is being transcended" (xiv). The time is ripe for a freer, hermeneutical approach, an attempt at integration, a search for an 'Indo-Ignatian' spirituality.

These 'reflections' do not strictly follow the order of the text of the Exercises although the general outline of their development is recognizable throughout the first half of *Iñigo in India*. Twelve short chapters are distributed into two parts: general perspectives and orientations, more practical and concrete suggestions. We highlight here in particular what the 'Indian disciple' has to say about the Exercises in their Hindu context.

In Indian traditional terms, 'spiritual exercises' may conveniently be considered as '*sâdhana*', an active quest including "all the practices helpful to attain spiritual experience", or as '*mârga*', both a way and a method (69). Beyond this question of terminology, Indian spiritual traditions carry a rich diversity of practices related to breathing, to sitting and other postures, to methods of concentration, to the use of images, sounds and movements. These and similar methods can be approached in two ways. In the context of the Exercises, they may be used simply as techniques, "in so far as they are useful" (*tantum quantum*): see for instance the slow meditation proceeding word by word, praying by rhythm, praying mentally with each breath or respiration (*SpEx* §§ 258-260). But they may also be used in a more integrated way and become "elements in our spirituality" (73). "Yogic techniques and awareness exercises" may be of great help in order to "rediscover and experience the integrality of our being" (78). A deep awareness of God's presence or of "our rootedness in God" (79) is not just a preparatory step but already a prayerful experience.

Michael Amaladoss feels however that many yogic and concentration methods are better suited to those who follow a purely contemplative path, for instance in an ashram environment; moreover, such methods are likely to encourage individualistic trends already so common nowadays. What contemporary India needs most and what comes closer to the Ignatian spirituality of contemplation in action would be the way of *karma-yoga* (30; 112), in the line of the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ* and of Gandhi: "The contribution of Ignatian spirituality to Indian tradition will be to encourage the emergence of a large number of *karma yogis* and thus stabilize this trend both in the Church and in the country" (54). Of course, this spirituality in action should not be narrowed down in an exclu-

sive way but rather lived in complementarity with the other *mârga*-s or *yoga*-s: knowledge and loving devotion.

In the traditional understanding and practice of the SpEx the collective or social dimension is not sufficiently developed in spite of the fact that they foster a spirituality of service. And a similar lack is to be deplored in much of the Hindu traditions. For instance, "both Hinduism and Christianity seem to focus on the individual sinner. They were not unaware of unjust structures or of *adharma*. But they did not reflect too much on them" (34). Similarly, there is little attention to the socio-political conditions or environment in the process of discernment and 'election': "Neither Ignatius nor the Indian tradition may have spelt out the concrete consequences in the socio-structural sphere of the ongoing struggle between good and evil. But the basic principles are there to inspire and guide us" (38).

Granted that the SpEx are meant to help and orientate believers towards a life of service, "a common search for the will of God will certainly facilitate common commitment and common action" (53). A particular chapter, "Transformation and Communion", is dedicated to this question. It is true that "individually directed retreats are becoming the norm today" (91). At the same time, "we need a social movement. Can the *Exercises* be used to form, shape and animate a group?" (92) "In recent years we have developed ways of discerning in common. We could extend the same perspective to the whole of the *Exercises*. The *Exercises* then are done as a group" (100).

We shall not go further into this question here, except to take note of a possible or even probable consequence in multireligious countries like India: it will be "a challenge for us to adapt and create *a new set of Exercises* that are suitable for a multi-religious group. (...) I think that such a task will not be a difficult one" (100-101). Michael Amaladoss does not elaborate further. He had however, in connection with the meditations on the mysteries of the life of Jesus, made the following observation: "I wonder whether, without in any way weakening our commitment to Jesus and our attachment to the mysteries of his life, passion, death and resurrection as a model and as a way, we could not also take into account other manifestations of God, as reported whether in the Old Testament or in other religious traditions" (30; cf. 53).

Javier MELLONI s.j., *The Exercises of St Ignatius and Traditions of the East* (= Inigo Text Series 14), Leominster, Gracewing / New Malden, Inigo Enterprises, 2013, vii-66 p.

As announced in the title, the scope of this little book (originally published in Spanish) is not limited to Hinduism. It covers both Hindu and Buddhist matters, more specifically Yoga (in a broad sense) and Zen, in continuous comparison with the SpEx (see the 3-column tables on pages 5 and 50). In many ways, Hinduism appears here to occupy an intermediate or more inclusive (and also more complex and differentiated) position between the other two. Select Hindu, Buddhist and Christian traditions are considered here as spiritual pathways: "Above all, what certainly unites the three ways is that they are not speculative, but initiatory or mystagogical. Their objective is the transformation of the person" (1).

A first chapter presents fundamental features or key elements of each tradition in a rather analytic and static way: the (human and divine) persons or subjects involved, the ultimate goal, the main practices and tools, the inner dispositions expected from the participant, the obstacles on the way, and so on. These items appear somehow as separate building blocks but they provide the basic information required for further inquiries. In the second chapter, entitled "Dynamisms", convergences and divergences acquire greater visibility when the key elements are taken up in the practice and the dynamic process of each pathway.

The Exercises are first compared with two distinct forms of Indian Yoga: the eight 'members' or steps described in the classical *Yoga-Sûtras* of Patañjali (note however the author's tendency to interpret Yoga in the light of Advaita Vedânta) and the three paths or '*yoga*-s' taught by Krishna in the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ*: disinterested action and service, inner knowledge, loving devotion. On the Buddhist side, the Exercises are confronted with the famous poems and pictures illustrating the Search of the Bull, the stages of the quest for enlightenment and true Self according to the Zen school. At each step, the author suggests parallels with elements taken from the SpEx: annotations, stages of meditation, rules for the discernment of spirits... Some are illuminating, others may be less convincing. Comparison is a tricky task, particularly in the case of the Chinese Chan and Japanese Zen schools where the graduated exercises of other Buddhist branches are left aside and enlightenment is conceived as sudden and unforeseeable.

The great advantage and merit of this essay is the constant attention to the dynamic progress on each of the three paths without neglecting, for that matter, essential differences in the doctrines which they presuppose. The confrontation of three (or even four) different traditions allows fresh insights but at the risk of complexity and impaired visibility. The Conclusions nevertheless clearly highlight some of the main differences: the specific proposal of the SpEx is "to sustain an election, a commitment, a concrete act of liberty in history. By contrast, Yoga and Zen enter into the non-temporality of the present moment, through non-discursivity, and seek reintegration into the primordial Unity" (60). To be fair, this contrast should not be overemphasized: as clearly stated by the author, the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ* has a message of selfless action while the last image in the Search of the Bull shows the peasant coming back to the market place and "mingling with the people of the world".

Finally, about the compatibility of Yoga or Zen with Christian spiritual life, the author proposes a useful distinction: such practices do not have the same meaning and import when resorted to before the SpEx, as a sort of preparation, or after them and taking their experience and their fruit into account (61-62).

The Spiritual Exercises and Buddhism

By way of a prelude to this section on the SpEx and Buddhism, let us remember a significant turn in the life and spiritual itinerary of Ignatius of Loyola. After the 1521 battle at Pamplona, during a long convalescence in his family castle of Loyola, Ignatius read and read again two books about the life of Christ and the lives of the saints (*Leyen-*

da de los santos or *Flos sanctorum* by Iácopo da Varazze or Vorágine). This popular illustrated compilation included the edifying story of Barlaam and Josaphat. This is actually a story about the Buddha (Josaphat = Bodhisattva) that underwent several translations and retellings on its way from India to the Middle East and Europe. Under the name of Josaphat, the Buddha became incognito a saint with his own feast day in the Christian calendar! Some details in this story seem to have left their imprint on the prayer Ignatius later composed for the Meditation on the call of a king (*SpEx* §§ 93ff). [see GISPERT-SAUCH 2008]

Hugo M. ENOMIYA-LASSALLE s.j. (1898-1990), *Zazen und die Exerzitien des heiligen Ignatius. Einübung in das wahre Dasein*, Köln, Bachem, 1975, 86 p.

Widely acknowledged as a pioneer in the practice of Zen meditation and its spread among Christians in Japan and particularly in the West, Fr Enomiya-Lassalle published a number of books, pamphlets and articles to offer basic information about *zazen* (seated meditation) and to help Christians, lay people as well as priests and religious, reflect upon the relationship between the practice of Zen and their own faith. A specific consideration of Ignatian spirituality and the Spiritual Exercises in relation to Zen is however mostly restricted to occasional remarks. The main and perhaps only significant exception is a little book published in German in 1975. The subtitle "*Einübung in das wahre Dasein*" (or "*wahre Sein*", p. 76) signals the predominantly practical approach.

First come presentations of the full program of the Exercises and of a Zen *sesshin*, a period of retreat and intensive meditation. The description of the latter is much shorter since no matter is prescribed for Zen meditation (with the possible exception of *kôan*-s): unlike in the SpEx, the practice of *zazen* does not change from day to day or week to week. After these necessary pieces of information, the little book surveys differences and common points between the two types of exercises.

Fr Lassalle first offers comments on some points of divergence. These are the consequences of the main purpose: while typically the SpEx provide a method to discover and follow the will of God in the disposition of one's life, *zazen*'s essential and only aim is to reach enlightenment, that is to become aware of our Buddha nature or to see the true nature of oneself and everything. The Ignatian exercitant is given every day food for meditation or contemplation and is invited to make full use of his faculties of memory, intellect and will as well as imagination; *zazen* is an exercise in non-thinking: even *kôan*-s, if and when they are used, are not exactly an object for thought. In this sense, it would not be wrong to state that "where the Exercises cease, *zazen* begins" (41).

As a consequence, to the extent that the Exercises are geared to an 'election', to making and taking important decisions, they can hardly be repeated year after year; *zazen*, on the contrary, is an always unfinished task, to be pursued day after day, year after year. To put it in terms of space: the election process in the SpEx is like a horizontal movement towards and up to a given aim; *zazen* is a silent vertical movement digging deeper and deeper without limit (42). The Ignatian exercitant needs to submit the inner movements of the soul to a discernment of spirits (good/bad, divine/demoniac) while the *zazen* meditator, following the instructions of the retreat master, should seek what-

ever is helpful and, as a rule, rather ignore both 'good' and 'bad' mental images. A fundamental difference is, of course, the absence, on the Buddhist side, of a relation to the Buddha comparable with the growth of a personal relation to Christ in the Exercises; in *zazen* and during the *sesshin*, there is thus no parallel to prayer and in particular to the Ignatian 'colloquies'.

Next to these divergences, similarities are equally important and significant: staying away from home and the usual business, keeping a strict silence, a stable body posture, long periods of meditation, regular contact with the retreat master or guide... We are referred here several times to the Annotations Ignatius offers as advice for the person who gives the SpEx. Lassalle then provides a rather detailed commentary on the rules of discernment for the first and the second Weeks. Although Zen masters have no comparable formal set of directives and while their style may often be rude, it will be found that their spiritual pedagogy in times of consolation or desolation is not very different. In Buddhist perspective, awakening or enlightenment may be considered as a consolation without any preceding cause.

What is required above all from those who follow the path of the Exercises or the path of Zen is an ever more rigorous detachment, the key to true liberation or inner freedom. One should note that Ignatius has in mind inordinate attachments and tendencies while Buddhists usually are invited to shun all types of attachments and desires. Significant at the doctrinal level, this difference however may not have the same weight in the practice of both paths (75-76).

Throughout, whether about divergences or common points, Fr Lassalle introduces many nuances that cannot be taken into account in a very short space. Our brief and dry summary obviously fails to communicate the gist of many concrete and lively notes based on the author's experience and observations in both Buddhist and Christian environments.

In a brief concluding section, Fr Lassalle explores areas where the Zen *sesshin* and the SpEx may be mutually complementary "even if a true synthesis is hardly possible" (77). A few Christians have started making attempts in that direction. One obstacle to genuine mutuality on the Buddhist side is that the very existence of the Ignatian Exercises is hardly known in Zen circles. According to Fr Lassalle (writing in 1975) the demand for *sesshin* is declining in Japan and there is little effort to adapt Zen to modern culture and ways of life. Some Japanese masters even feel that Zen, after a successful transplantation in the West, may one day come back to Japan in another garb. Underway, will it find helpful to take a leaf from the Ignatian book? Can that happen without loosing something essential?

Daniel J. O'HANLON s.j. (1919-1992), "Zen and the Spiritual Exercises: A Dialogue Between Faiths", *Theological Studies* 39 / 4, 1978, 737-768.

A professor at the Berkeley Jesuit School of Theology, Daniel O'Hanlon spent a full sabbatical year in India, South-East and East Asia in order to get acquainted with various spiritual traditions of the East. He had been "making, giving, and studying the Spiritual Exercises over a period of almost forty years" and involved in Zen practice for

five or six years, including a few *sesshin*-s (738 n. 5). His long and dense article is also the fruit of a course he taught at Berkeley on Zen and the SpEx. The intention is "not simply to compare the experiences in order to understanding them better, but for the purpose of deepening and enriching the tradition of the Spiritual Exercises" (738). We are warned that this is a study of two very particular traditional disciplines: "If, for instance, we were to make a comparative study of a certain form of Tibetan Buddhist spiritual discipline, with its intricate visualizations and strong emphasis on discursive reasoning, and the apophatic mysticism of the *Cloud of Unknowing*, much of what we have to say about Zen and the Spiritual Exercises would be reversed" (739).

As this contribution covers much of the same ground as Fr Lassalle's little book, we shall not give a full summary but rather highlight a few significant observations.

Goal or Purpose – There is some debate about the goal of the SpEx: election and/or union with God? The purpose of Zen is enlightenment together with the will to save all sentient beings. There is nevertheless some overlap between these two programs. And there is "something to be learned about detachment in the goallessness of Zen... In some paradoxical sense, goallessness is the goal, and desirelessness is what we should desire" (744).

Means – *Zazen* excludes any object of meditation or contemplation. It is silent sitting, 'just sitting' (*shikan-taza*) or perhaps grappling with a *kôan* prescribed by the meditation master (*rôshi*). Reporting the fact that, when teaching Trappist monks, a Japanese master gives them the cross as their *kôan*, Fr O'Hanlon adds: "Could we not regard Ignatius' third degree of humility as a *kôan*?" (747 n. 55) The manifestation of visions or other 'diabolical phenomena' (*makyo*) is taken in Zen as "a sign of progress, just as in the Exercises the experience of consolation and desolation shows that the process is under way". Such visions however are not interpreted as signs or messages suggesting an orientation; they should rather be disregarded. Quiet sitting, watching the breath and other Eastern methods of stilling the mind obviously may be helpful for Ignatian exercitants. The question is: should they be used as simple preliminaries or could they occupy "a more central position in the Exercises" without interfering with their particular dynamism? (748)

Director or Rôshi – A Zen meditation master should have had some experience of enlightenment and got a formal seal of approval; he is then pretty much left on his own. In Zen "the principal resource for discernment... is the enlightened and compassionate *rôshi*" (758). A director of the Exercises, on the other hand, finds more detailed instructions in the Ignatian booklet. Perhaps the main lesson he can learn from Zen is that "the degree of helpful insight and illumination he can bring to the exercitant is very closely related to his own holiness" (751).

Discursive vs. Intuitive Modes – This is a "key issue". The goal of Zen is "to cease discursive thinking and arrive at a direct intuition of one's nature. Discursive methods are not only not cultivated but actively discouraged" (751). Clearly, discursive reasoning is present in the SpEx but has frequently been given too much weight in the last centuries. What Ignatius calls '*sentire*', 'feeling' the things of God, particularly in connection with the process of the election, "is certainly higher than discursive reasoning and must

be ranked among the 'spiritual senses'" (752). The Application of the Senses too operates at a more intuitive level. The Zen emphasis on this dimension may thus "challenge to rediscover what lies at the heart of the Ignatian process" (754).

Personal / Impersonal – The doctrine of 'no self' or 'no person' is fundamental in Buddhism. And this has deep consequences for the understanding of freedom and relationships, history, sin and forgiveness, grace and so on. However, this contrast between Zen and the Exercises should not be reduced to a simple yes or no. "Let us be modest in our claims to understand just what is meant by referring to reality as personal or impersonal" (766).

William JOHNSTON s.j. (1925-2010), *Mystical Journey. An Autobiography*, Maryknoll, Orbis Books, 2006, x-230 p.

An Irish Jesuit missionary to Japan, William Johnston is the author of a number of widely-read books on spiritual life and mysticism, including *The Still Point: Reflections on Zen and Christian Mysticism* (1970) and *Christian Zen* (1971). He developed a deep interest in Far Eastern traditions of contemplative prayer but was equally anxious to meet various forms of spiritual quest in the contemporary West, not excluding advances in psychology or the recovery of symbolic language. However, his own experience with *zazen* was rather short-lived: "Now I see that my interest was not really in Zen as such but in deepening my own life of prayer" (134). And, on the Christian side, he quotes far more frequently from the *Cloud of Unknowing* or John of the Cross than from the Ignatian *Exercises*. There is thus in his oeuvre hardly any sustained treatment of the SpEx in the light of Zen or other Asian traditions. His observations and queries are rather to be found in his *Autobiography*.

His bittersweet experience with the SpEx started with his 30-day retreat as a novice: "I confess that it is not easy for me to speak about the Exercises, since I have been fighting with them all through my Jesuit life, always searching for authentic Jesuit spirituality. (...) These Exercises, practiced once in the noviceship, were a great grace for me. The problem was that after a short time in the noviciate and a few subsequent years I felt drawn to a new and different form of prayer. I felt called, in a way I could scarcely resist, to recite an ejaculation or a mantra such as the word 'Jesus' or... 'Come, Holy Spirit'. (...) I would sometimes feel drawn into a deep silence or emptiness without any words at all." (31)

The dryness and cerebral character of the philosophical studies did not help: "For me personally the problem with scholasticism was that it was too wordy, whereas my life of prayer was going beyond words and reasoning and thinking into silence. (...) Nor was I satisfied with the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius as they were given in our yearly retreat. They also were wordy and encouraged wordy prayer. (...) The Exercises, as I received them at that time, were on the top level of consciousness." (51)

During a period of study in Rome (1958) and with the benefit of his first years in Japan, he observes: "I have found it helpful to make a distinction between what I call horizontal prayer and vertical prayer. The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius, as I had learned them in my noviceship, had taught me horizontal prayer. That is to say, they had

drawn me through a series of meditations at the top level of consciousness, encouraging me to reflect (...). Vertical prayer, on the other hand, draws one down into the deeper, unconscious levels of the personality. It leads one into the cloud of unknowing where one is frequently silent, in love with God. (...) I found that I was distancing myself from standard Jesuit spirituality. (...) Ignatius was himself a mystic. He did not spend his life going through the Spiritual Exercises." (87)

These reflections obviously modify the way he preaches retreats and gives the Exercises. About his spiritual ministries in the 1970s he writes: "In Japan I have given 'contemplative retreats,' encouraging my listeners to repeat the mantra of their choice and to enter into contemplative silence. I have done this also in the United States. (...) I always suggest that people pray in a contemplative way, repeating their mantra or becoming aware of their breathing or entering into silence, and I do not talk about the so-called 'exercises' which can sometimes sound like mental gymnastics." (138) William Johnston is convinced that, beyond his personal style of prayer, such deep trends are the sign of a new spiritual era: "I am still wary of directing everyone at the top level of consciousness, that is to say, at the level of discursive prayer. I believe that today we are seeing a step forward in evolution. People everywhere are looking for vertical meditation whereby they can experience the deeper levels of awareness and look into their unconscious. That is why so many look to the East..." (141)

Looking to the East, we may be better aware that the spirituality of Ignatius should not be restricted to the booklet of the Exercises: "Both John of the Cross and Ignatius of Loyola entered into mystical prayer, one to be united with God in silence, the other to work for the salvation of the world. It is at this mystical level that Ignatius will dialogue with the East and get new insights. The Exercises may have some value for beginners, but eventually one must move beyond them into contemplation." (142)

The urge to practice silent contemplation leads him to a different way of balancing text (the SpEx, the Bible) and silence, even when giving the Exercises to a group of Jesuits doing their tertianship in the Philippines in the early 1980s: "Some tertians wanted to give up all thinking and to enter into the great wordless silence. I encouraged them, suggesting that they read the text of the Exercises outside the time of prayer, just as the Zen Buddhists chant the sutras and then enter into silence. Above all, I told them – as I tell all Christians who enter into silent prayer – to read sacred scripture as a jumping off ground for contemplation." (170)

J. K. [Kakichi] KADOWAKI s.j. (1926-2017), *Zen and the Bible. A Priest's Experience*, London / Boston, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1980, xii-180 p.

Kakichi Kadowaki received his education, particularly at high school, in a Zen Buddhist atmosphere and spirit. He discovered the Christian faith during his university studies, was baptized and soon applied to become a member of the Society of Jesus. Towards the end of his period of formation and study as a Jesuit, he became again more and more interested in the practice of Zen meditation, in particular under Master Ômori Sôgen. His sitting practice was in the line of the Rinzai school, with due emphasis on chewing the *kôan*-s and regularly confronting his experience and understanding in pri-

vate interviews (*dokusan*) with the meditation master. He discovered that *zazen* unexpectedly allowed him fresh insights into the reading of the Bible. Unsatisfied with mental or cerebral approaches to theology and spirituality, he became aware of the importance of the 'body', that is the global and dynamic unity of all dimensions of the individual person, including one's relation to all living beings.

Picking up a tradition going back to Dôgen and Nichiren, two 13th-century Japanese Buddhist masters, Kadowaki developed a method of 'body-reading' applied to both Zen *kôan*-s and Bible excerpts ("Body-Reading Kôans and the Bible" was the original title of his 1977 Japanese-language book). The central and longer part of *Zen and the Bible* provides illustrations of this joint 'reading' of a traditional Zen 'case' (*kôan*) – or sometimes a quotation from Dôgen's *Shôbôgenzô* – and an excerpt from the New Testament, mostly from the gospels. Particularly striking is his "Silence speaks" chapter offering a contemplation of Jesus and the adulterous woman (John 8) in the light of the famous case "Master Gutei holds up a finger". Considered together, these two stories manifest the forceful compassion of both masters and their skilful use of body language as well as the importance of silence.

The last third of the book (six chapters) examines similarities between the Ignatian Exercises and a Zen *sesshin*. The reader may be taken aback by the fact that, most of the times, the Buddhist story quoted and commented upon seems, at first sight, to have no connection with the Ignatian exercise. Indeed, the similarities are not superficial ones. And they operate at the level of practise during a *sesshin* or an Ignatian retreat rather than in terms of doctrinal comparisons. The similarities are rather structural ones in the dynamic unfolding and spiritual process of the Christian and the Buddhist exercises. "Now then, what if we compare the existential orientations that remain in Christianity and Zen after the practitioner has dispelled all concepts? Speaking from my own meagre experience, I would say that the two differ in a fine point regarding their ultimate aims, but that in regard to their overall framework and structure they are very similar" (89).

Following the thread of the Ignatian booklet, whether in meditations such as the Kingdom or the Three Kinds of Humility, in contemplation of gospel scenes such as the crucifixion, and even in the Rules as regards eating, the author highlights some fundamental laws governing spiritual life and growth both on the Christian and on the Buddhist path. Doctrinal or even anthropological differences are never brushed aside. The very text of the Christian Scripture and of the *kôan* with its traditional commentaries has to be carefully examined beforehand. But when the time comes for silent appropriation and personal transformation, a fundamental law of inner conversion operates, a dynamic law of death and resurrection, of 'Great Death' and 'Great Life'. Through his intimate experience, the exercitant discovers that, in Christian terms, "the cross *is* the resurrection".

Rooted in a prolonged and rigorous practice of Zen under Buddhist guides and in a refreshing 'body-reading' of the Bible and the Exercises, *Zen and the Bible*, in its simple if at times dense and exacting language, strikes a singularly original chord.

Ruben L.F. HABITO, *Zen and the Spiritual Exercises. Paths of Awakening and Transformation*, Maryknoll, Orbis, 2013, xxv-237 p.

A Filipino by birth, the author spent many years in Japan and later in the United States. He has a long experience both in the personal practice of these two spiritual ways and in the direction of retreats and *sesshin*-s. The Ignatian Exercises and Zen appear to be widely different in "their underlying religious worldviews, general orientations, practical prescriptions, and even stated outcomes" (xvii). To put it bluntly and more concretely: "the Exercises take a left-brained, discursive, analytical, purpose-oriented, thoroughly Christian approach, while Zen is a right-brained, nondiscursive, intuitive form of Buddhist spiritual practice that is nontheistic in its approach" (xix). The contrast is particularly striking in the process of discernment and election: where Ignatius, drawing lessons from his own experience, formulates a series of detailed guidelines preparatory to decision-making, Zen rather invites to "let go of our discriminating mind and let choices come in a spontaneous way" (124).

Should we conclude that Zen and the Exercises are incompatible? Ruben Habito formulates and suggests positive answers to a double question: "What can those who undertake the Spiritual Exercises learn from Zen practice in a way that may enhance and enrich their experience and appreciation of the Exercises? Conversely, what can Zen practitioners learn from the Exercises in a way that enhances their Zen path?" (xxiv) He notes profound mutual resonances and some parallelisms in the steps or main stages leading towards the goal: preparation of the way, purification, illumination, union (to put it in traditional Christian terms).

Both traditions propose a path of transformation leading from an 'I-me-mine' self-centred mentality to an awakening to interconnectedness, a mature practice of contemplation in action, a life of loving and compassionate service. All along, the book follows rather closely what the author considers as the key moments in the process of the 4-Week Exercises. The reader will find, in a modernized language, samples of suggestions for meditation and contemplation. Silent, wordless and imageless sitting, possibly combined with 'bodily reading' of Bible excerpts and/or the use of *kôan*-s or *kôan*-like paradoxes, may help the exercitant deepen and integrate the process of the SpEx.

So much for the fruit that a (Christian) exercitant may derive from some Buddhist teachings and, more to the point, from Zen practices. From time to time, while following the thread of the Exercises, Habito suggests some points where (Buddhist) Zen practitioners may find help and orientation from the Ignatian method and practices. He is however well aware that they may not easily be persuaded to take that path. Actually, the rather simple Buddhist / Christian divide may not depict anymore the spiritual situation of many people in countries like the United States, Europe and perhaps the Far East. Quite a large number of individuals in the West practice Zen (or some other Oriental) meditation without fully adhering to the doctrinal heritage of the Buddhist *dharma*. Conversely, Buddhists, or former Buddhists, or persons understanding themselves as agnostics or 'spiritual but not religious', are willing to explore the riches of particular Christian traditions, including the Ignatian Exercises.

Running through the book as a red thread, the question – or one significant and relatively new question – then becomes: is it possible, is it meaningful to give the Ignatian Exercises to such persons? "Can non-Christians undertake the Ignatian Exercises in a way that leads them to the spiritual transformation that the Exercises intend?" (13) And how should one proceed about it? Habito suggests "an approach that brackets or sets aside the doctrinal and theological issues around the identity of Jesus"; he invites "Christian and non-Christian seekers of the Way to open their minds, hearts, and entire being to simply immerse themselves in what is presented in the scriptural texts: to be one with Jesus". The suggestion is to enter the contemplative exercises "only keeping in mind that we are fixing our gaze on Jesus as manifesting and embodying what we earnestly seek: the Way" (15). This thread will be picked up again below when presenting the essays by Roger Haight and Erin Cline.

Yves RAGUIN s.j. (1912-1998), « Les techniques orientales de méditation et les Exercices de saint Ignace », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* VII / 28 (oct.-déc. 1983) 227-251.

Oriental types of meditation seem nowadays to draw larger audiences than Christian proposals. Is it just the latest fad? Or should we read there a sign of our times? How far could these Eastern methods be integrated in the practice of the Ignatian Exercises? The first and fundamental challenge is to pinpoint the essentials of the Ignatian way – from the Principle and Foundation up to the Meditation to obtain love –, the main steps and indispensable articulations without which the specific character of the SpEx would be lost.

However, according to the Annotations and other indications to be found in Ignatius' booklet, the goal can be reached with the help of several different methods: meditation according to the three powers (memory, intellect, will), contemplation based on Gospel texts, repetition, application of the senses, three other ways of praying (§§ 238-260), and so on. These methods should be adapted to the situation of each exercitant. For instance, the rhythm of each retreat day is meant to gradually foster more simple types of prayer. The value of these methods appears thus to be relative and should be appreciated in connection with the Ignatian essentials and the final goal: the union with God and the conformity to Christ.

In their symbolic language and their theological or spiritual perspectives, the SpEx bear the marks of sixteenth-century Western conceptions: divine transcendence, human praise, and service. According to those worldviews, everything comes down from above. During the latest decades, however, psychology, existential philosophies and Eastern religions have modified our perceptions. "The source is not above anymore, but below. The Spirit itself does not descend upon us as on the day of Pentecost, but rises from the depth of our hearts. From a theology of transcendence we move towards a theology of immanence... and interiority" (237).

According to Yves Raguin, "without altering the essential dynamics of the *Exercises*, it is possible to look at the Principle and Foundation, indifference, sin, and so on from a perspective of origin or source rather than in terms of human activity and the goal to be reached, as formulated in Ignatius' text" (238). Such a perspective from below, from the inner source, would bring us closer to Eastern spiritualities, particularly to Daoism

ignaziana
rivista di ricerca teologica

and Buddhism. It would at the same time coincide with Christ's attitude: he does not submit himself to the will of God in an act of external obedience but fully receives himself from the Father, the source and root of his very existence. Similarly, indifference is not so much a series of acts of detachment but, at the root, an inner disposition of adherence to God's design inscribed at the bottom of our being. We may draw here some inspiration from the Buddhist practice of no-thought, non-possession, silence and openness. Again, sin may be seen first of all as a disruption or a misuse of the energies we receive from God. This way of proceeding through the Exercises would be an excellent preparation for the Contemplation to obtain love.

Broaching then the question of practical methods, it would be plainly insufficient to rest content with such analogies as praying according to the rhythm of the breath (*SpEx* §§ 258-260). The question is rather: how can persons familiar with Zen or Yoga go through the Exercises? In the third and last section of his article, Yves Raguin examines two different methods. The first one, explained and advocated by Anthony de Mello in his *Sâdhana*, is an adaptation of the Buddhist practice of *vipassanâ* based on the *Satipatthâna Sûtra*, a method of pure and simple awareness. The second one draws its inspiration mainly from the Zen tradition. No single affirmation can be adequate to the mystery of things, the mystery of my own self, and even less to the mystery of God. Chan or Zen, it is true, recommends a radical version of voidness, no-thought and objectless meditation (although the term "meditation" may not be adequate anymore). But great Christian mystics too remind us that God cannot be an object of our thinking. When we seek the image of God in ourselves, or even when we seek God, it is rather God himself who desires to make himself known. The practice of Zen may thus prove helpful to Christians. It has brought some of them to the rediscovery of the *Cloud of Unknowing* and similar Christian mystical writings. It may also inspire a simpler and deeper way to proceed along the path of the Exercises.

At this point, a last question has to be tackled: what is the place of Christ in the practice of simple awareness or objectless meditation? Will he be pushed aside? Will he tacitly fade out of the picture? Most Christians tend to see Christ as a bridge on the road to God or as an intermediary. Christ is and should remain at the centre. But in the practice of no-thought or objectless meditation, He is no more the 'object' of my attention. Invisible to my eyes, but present in my very own centre, He unifies all my activities and, with the power of His Spirit, makes me look at the Father as He looks at the Father. Eastern methods of meditation may help us rediscover this interior divine presence, a leitmotiv of the SpEx from the second Annotation ("intimate feeling and relishing of things") till the Contemplation for obtaining love.

Bernard SENÉCAL s.j., *Jésus le Christ à la rencontre de Gautama le Bouddha. Identité chrétienne et bouddhisme*, Paris, Cerf, 1998, 252 p.

The sub-title, "Christian Identity and Buddhism", probably best describes the main focus and challenge of this complex, multi-layered book. A French Canadian by birth, the author went to France for medical studies. At the age of about twenty-five, he rediscovered his Christian identity, became a Jesuit and later joined the Korean province

where he taught history of religions, especially Buddhism, gave retreats and developed interreligious relationships. Although this essay is not first of all about the SpEx, Ignatian spirituality and the Exercises are present as one of the main threads.

Daily life in the Far East, advanced studies of Buddhism and the Korean religions, apostolic work in multireligious societies where 'multiple religious belonging' is quite common, and above all the frequent practice of Buddhist meditation: these combined factors triggered a severe and prolonged 'christological crisis' as well as spiritual impasse. The Ignatian Exercises had been very helpful at the time of Bernard's reappropriation of the Christian faith and his first years as a Jesuit. They then progressively appeared as irrelevant due to their Christological garb, their ecclesiological perspective (or ecclesial 'imaginaire') and their spiritual pedagogy (43).

At a deeper level, the regular practice of Buddhist meditation, in the distinct but rather similar (78) traditions of (Korean) Son/Zen and (South Asian) Vipassanâ, left the impression that the way of Christ might be just one among many: other spiritual paths seemed equally able to lead towards an experience of the Absolute (63). Buddhist meditation seems to have the power to dissolve the mystery of Christ, to make it so to say irrelevant. One may then feel like a frog leaping out of its well and discovering the vast expanse of the ocean. Will it still make sense to speak of a Christocentric history of salvation? And is the very idea of God still a universal one? Some Christians may feel drawn towards a 'Buddha-centric' way. At the doctrinal level, this challenge will inspire the search for a renewed theology of the plurality of religions (this is developed in the third and last part of the book). Another important issue broached in this essay is the relation between the spiritual experience and the concepts and words we use to express it and reflect on it.

But the crisis has first of all to be addressed at the personal and spiritual level. One of the issues more closely connected with the SpEx is the way they prescribe meditation on the mysteries of the life, death and resurrection of Christ. When small 'slices' of gospel stories – or rather their summary or paraphrase – are taken out of their context and read as if they belonged to one single text, the particular approach and dynamics of each of the four gospels taken as a whole is lost sight of. The danger is that materials taken from the gospels are formatted and put at the service of the Exercises and their own dynamics rather than the other way round! Nowadays, we do not and cannot read the Scriptures the way Christians did it in the sixteenth century and in the context of the Counter-Reformation.

Learning to read (and meditate or contemplate) one gospel at a time as a single and coherent whole, from beginning to end, was for the author a discovery that helped him retrieve the figure of Christ in a more dynamic and challenging way. This experience of the transforming power of each gospel played a significant role in his personal relation to Christ and towards a new and freer understanding of the encounter between the Christ and the Buddha, even if, as he notes by way of parenthesis, "the question of the mutual relation between the Christ and the Buddha still awaited its solution" (116; see 163).

The decisive factor or rather decisive event that helped him out of the impasse belongs however to the realm of direct experience. He refers, with some hesitation lest it

appears as a lack of discretion, to two experiences that he labels 'consolation without cause'. The first one, a "sudden breach in the wall", took place at Loyola, during a retreat in preparation for the priesthood. In Bernard's practice, the prescribed Ignatian exercises alternated with periods of Vipassanâ meditation. During one of these, he unexpectedly received the gift to "taste the perfect integration of this form of meditation with the Ignatian contemplation theme for the day: the passion of Jesus Christ, Our Lord. Ignatian prayer and Vipassanâ meditation melted into a single movement elevating the soul. It was no more the one or the other, but both together without the least trace of opposition or incompatibility, in the full respect of the original identity of each. (...) The mystery of Christ, that had been blurred for about a year, was given anew." (69)

The author interpreted this experience of consolation as an opening of horizon for his future task: to enter deeper into the world of Zen, to examine his (Ignatian) spirituality of reference, to delve further into the mystery of Christ and his Church in the light of the gospels, and to attempt a theological interpretation of this integration (70; see also 162; 182).

A second consolation without preceding cause was granted about three years later, during a meditation session at a Korean Buddhist monastery. It came as a confirmation or accomplishment. "Very quietly and in the space of what seemed just one second, I felt that deep inside me the painful tension between the Buddha and the Christ that had torn me during the last few years had dissolved once for all" (220). Bernard perceived a paradoxical correspondence between strenuous efforts at reaching the Absolute in the steps of the Buddha and the fully gratuitous gift of God revealing himself in his Word becoming flesh. A radically Christocentric as well as broadly universal vision.

Bernard Senécal is convinced that, with due adaptations, the Ignatian Exercises provide a fit anchorage for the encounter between the Buddhist and Christian traditions (140). Among pioneers in this venture he mentions H.M. Enomiya-Lassalle, J.K. Kadowaki and W. Johnston. Bernard regularly offers retreat programs (*sesshin*) where the dynamics of Zen and the Ignatian one are put at the service of a continuous reading of gospel text, during the session or in regular group meetings throughout the year (146-152). Such programs "mean, of course, that there is a christianization of Zen" (153). They meet the expectations of a number of Christians, particularly in the West, who started practising Buddhist types of meditation.

AMA SAMY s.j., "Ignatianische Exerzitien und Zen-Meditation (Geistliche Ansprachen vor indischen Ordensleuten)", *Geist und Leben* 79 / 5 (2006) 360-374 [I]; 79 / 6 (2006) 440-457 [II].

In this two-part article, based on addresses given in 2002-2003 to Indian Christian religious, the author does not attempt a detailed comparison between themes or methods of Zen meditation and the Spiritual Exercises. He intends rather to highlight their differences and above all to show that they can complement each other.

[I] Ama Samy first sketches some of the significant crises and challenges of today. Many people, including Christians and Christian priests and religious, experience a dark night in their spiritual life. The inherited words, images and symbols do not reveal God

anymore. Is God merely the projection of our needs? Can He still be a 'Thou' for us? Should we denounce our religious thoughts and institutions as self-serving dualistic objectifications? In our post-modern world, we have no ground to stand on. We need a radical awakening from our native illusions and absence of genuine knowledge.

Zen is one possible way out of our contemporary dilemma. The SpEx, it is true, open a way of conversion of the self and identification with Christ, but they leave us inside a traditional world of meaning and values. Zen shows a way to letting go of all images and confronting darkness and doubt, life and death. In the SpEx we die *with* Christ; in Zen we die *to* Christ: the 'Great Death' means we have to die to the world, to the self, to God. We experience the bottomless Void. Zen is a path of awakening to emptiness or to the 'Formless Self'. In a non-dual perspective, we should awaken to God as "not-one and not-two".

The SpEx and Zen could however complement each other, provided Zen be considered not as a mere preliminary method but respectfully approached with due consideration of its Buddhist roots. It is a matter of actually 'passing over' to Zen and 'coming back' to our own (Christian, Ignatian) tradition. A matter of experiencing the tension of "standing in the in-between". The voidness or vacuity of our world and our life, the unitive experience of non-duality of self and universe: these are central aspects of Zen practice and spirituality that can enrich, deepen, challenge and transform the Ignatian prayer and spirituality. Zen is a path of detachment and equanimity or holy indifference, a path of letting go. Zen stresses the importance of no-thought, of emptying the mind, of leaving aside representations, feelings, concepts and all the discursive operations at work not only in daily life but in the practice of the SpEx.

In a Zen perspective, the Ultimate is nothing but the finite realities: *samsâra* is *nirvâna*, and *nirvâna* is *samsâra*. The Ultimate may never be made into an object. Just let everything be as it is. Just be open and allow the spontaneous manifestation of the world. Enlightenment and compassion are but the two sides of the same coin. Zen invites to be both detached and engaged. It is true however that, while Zen is great in the discernment in matters of awakening, it is often poor in the discernment in matters of social relationships and compassionate action in daily life. Here again Zen and Ignatian spirituality can deepen and transform each other.

[II] The SpEx do not suit all Christians. They also suffer from limitations pertaining to the individual psychology of Ignatius and limitations due to the culture and mindset of his own century. If we want to avoid any Ignatian fundamentalism or literalism, we should make here a distinction between spirituality and method. 'Self-transformation' seems to belong nowadays to the 'signs of the times'. Many people experience a "rupture of the immediacy of belief and totalizing homogeneity". Many, in the West but even among the Indian Christians, suffer from the dualistic limitations of their theological thinking but are afraid of the perilous jump into non-duality.

That is where Eastern ways and methods, among them Vipassanâ and Zen, may be helpful (our Indian author seems to have more reservations where Hinduism is concerned). They offer a much-needed and clearly delineated praxis of meditation. But, to repeat, these ways should not be adopted and adapted in a shallow way by hastily trans-

forming them into, for instance, some sort of secure 'Christian Zen'. Genuine Zen (as much as the SpEx) is a way through death (the 'Great Death') into a new life. It opens a path towards a mystical process too long neglected in the usual practice of giving the Exercises. Is such an opening not the vocation or *raison d'être* of priests and religious? For those, Jesuits and others, who suffer nowadays from the insufficiencies of the SpEx, Zen and other Eastern ways should be considered as providing opportunities. If practised with due respect for their differences and their peculiar characteristics, Zen and the SpEx may well prove to be complementary. "I consider Buddhism and Zen as our [Jesuit] best travel companions" (457).

Edgar W. HARNACK, "Vom fernen Nächsten lernen. Ignatianische Exerzitien und tibetisches Tantra im Vergleich", *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie* 132 / 2 (1974) 182-199.

While the Zen schools, particularly in Japan and Korea, received a lot of attention, the Tantric schools belonging to the Buddhist Vajrayâna tradition, whether in Tibet or in Japan (Shingon), have been rather neglected in connection with the Spiritual Exercises. A psychotherapist working in the line of transpersonal behaviour therapy and a onetime editor of the *Jahrbuch für Spiritualität und Transzendentale Psychologie*, E. Harnack is convinced that the aim and design of the Spiritual Exercises are still valid but, after about five centuries, their methods are no longer well adapted to our contemporary culture and mental setup. We could learn a lot "from distant neighbours".

Contrary to the Zen objectless and immobile sitting, Tibetan tantric meditations make abundant use of symbols, images and visualizations, sonic and bodily practices. These methods and their graduated program are systematically described in manuals that have no counterpart in the Western and Christian world, with the exception, up to a point, of the Spiritual Exercises. The Tibetan symbolical world is too complex and too distant to be adopted as such, but significant features of the tantric methods and practices could be useful for an innovative renewal of the Exercises.

Both Tibetan and Ignatian practices have a strong cataphatic dimension perceptible in their active use of imagination, even if the timeless archetypical content (in C.G. Jung's terms) is more obvious in the first case while the Ignatian images and scenes are more closely connected with 'historical' data drawn from biblical accounts. Both however are designed to operate a lasting inner transformation of the meditator. In the tantric exercises, the images or visualizations of Buddhas and other religious figures, rather than being objects of prayer or 'colloquy', symbolize what the meditator has to become: they aim not only at a psychological or affective identification but ultimately at an ontological fusion between the meditator and the Buddhahood already present in germ (*tathâgata-garbha*). For Ignatius of course, there cannot be any substantial final identity: God remains the 'Other'. This also means that the relation between personal effort and supernal 'grace' is not identical in Buddhism and Christianity.

Compared with Tibetan (and other Oriental) traditions, most Christian spiritual paths show an "astonishing lack" of systematicity and didactic concern (192). Again, this is less obvious in the case of the Ignatian methodology. Nevertheless, useful lessons may be

drawn from the Tibetan Buddhist methods designed to guarantee continuity and progress along the path. In many ways, they have a function similar to the frequent 'Repetitions' in the Ignatian Exercises. To close on a rather tricky point: the dualistic conception of good vs. bad, virtue vs. sin, and the scenario of a king enrolling soldiers under his banner to conquer the enemy are much less meaningful nowadays, both from a psychological and ethical as well as spiritual point of view. Tantric teachings and practices suggest better ways, ways of transformation and integration rather than rejection and exclusion.

The author does not advocate a literal integration of Tibetan tantric practices into the SpEx. Such a cut and paste method would result in theological difficulties and be ill adapted to our own (Western) culture and arguably to many others. The form of the Exercises has to change in ways that preserve their spirit. "Mistakenly ignored by Christians, the methodical repertoire of Tibetan Buddhism is an appropriate source of inspiration" (199).

Steven SHIPPEE, "Buddhist Generation and Ignatian Contemplation: Skillful Use of the Imagination in Interreligious Contemplative Dialogue", *Dilatato Corde* (**www.dimmid.org**) 8 / 1 (2018) 1-20.

Even today, more than forty years after Harnack's paper, many Christians (and others as well) share the impression that Buddhist meditation is imageless or even contentless. In the Tibetan tradition of meditation however, particularly in the so-called "generation", "development", or "creation stage" (*kyerim*), as distinguished from the "completion stage" (*dzogrim*), imagination plays an important part. Similarly, most Buddhist practitioners are unaware of comparable "generation stage" practices in some Christian traditions, particularly in the Ignatian Exercises. Rather than advocating some form of dual belonging or dual practice, Shippee intends only to draw a comparison between two skilful uses of the imagination in spiritual practice in spite of essential differences in their doctrinal conceptions.

For this purpose, he selects first a particular *sâdhana* (exercise) attributed to Thangtong Gyalpo (15th century) and analyses its different stages. Visualization of *yidam* or 'deities' plays a decisive role in this type of Tibetan Buddhist practice. This should not be understood as "merely mentally picturing" something; it has nothing to do with "pretending": "Generation practice happens as much with heart and affect as with mind and images. Thus, while nontheistic, generation practice is indeed relational" (8). "The deities are not understood as *merely* representational but as buddhas compassionately helping sentient beings" (8). The object of this Tibetan practice (and of the Ignatian contemplation as well) "is never understood as fictional. Said differently, while 'imagined', it is never merely imaginary" (17).

As a concrete illustration of Ignatian contemplation practices, the author then considers the first one of the first day of the third week, namely Christ's journey from Bethany to Jerusalem for the Last Supper (*SpEx* §§ 190-199). The retreatant is invited to imagine or 'compose' (*composición*) the place where the story occurs: one 'sees' the road to Jerusalem, the room of the Last Supper, the persons present during the meal; one 'listens' to what they are saying.

A “notable difference is that while a *sâdhana* provides the very words to be recited..., Ignatius, with the exception of the concluding Our Father, leaves the choice of words to the retreatant” (12). But, from a close reading of both texts it appears, differences notwithstanding, that there are “rather striking parallels” not only in the specific practices and their transformative aims but in the “very ordering of the elements into a form useful for deep training” (15-16), as shown in a chart provided by the author:

[1] Setting one’s intention: Refuge and Bodhicitta vows / Ignatian preparatory prayer;
[2] Entering in through imagination: Generating the Deity / First (*historia*) and second (*composición*) Preludes or Preambles;
[3] Connecting affectively: Invoking and Supplicating / Petition;
[4] The main part: Union with the Truth: practicing the Deity Yoga / the Ignatian Points;
[5] Determining to follow-through: Implementing the practice in daily life / Colloquy;
[6] Returning to the intention to tread the path or way: Dedicating the roots of virtue and making aspirations / the Our Father. (19)

William REHG s.j., “Christian Mindfulness: A Path to Finding God in All Things”, *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* 34 / 3 (May 2002) 1-32.

Considering the potential breadth of mindfulness, Jesuit philosopher William Rehg intends to examine the “familiar Catholic and Jesuit traditions as providing us with specifically Christian practices of mindfulness”. Indeed, it is possible to look at a number of traditional Catholic prayer forms in connection with mindfulness. But, as a first step, this central Buddhist notion and its practices have to be briefly examined. Mindfulness goes back to the Buddha’s teachings on the “four foundations of mindfulness”. Continuous Vipassanâ or Insight meditation fosters the realization of impermanence and of our interdependence with all of reality. These are broad features that “promise to hold true of certain Christian practices in a way that does not simply assimilate these practices to Buddhism” (4).

William Rehg assumes that we can “meaningfully describe certain Christian practices in terms of a Christian notion of mindfulness that is both distinctive yet sufficiently similar at a more generic level to the Buddhist notion” (4). Indeed, there are distinctively Christian ways of attending to the moment-by-moment reality: a loving responsiveness to God’s creative and redeeming presence, a type of prayer that promotes a “discerning charity appropriate to each situation” (12). In connection with mindfulness, particular mention may be made of the Jesus prayer according to the *Philokalia* tradition and of the recently promoted “centering prayer”.

If we now turn to specific traits of Jesuit spirituality, we shall be well-advised to have a look at the Rules for discerning the spirits: being to a large extent descriptive of interior movements, they are the “most striking example of Christian mindfulness in the Exercises” (20); they provide “concrete ways of attending to God’s action in us and distinguishing that action from counterfeits”. According to the *Official Directory* of 1599, discernment primarily involves listening: “Simply listen to the voice of God and dispose [yourself] as best [you] can to hear that voice and receive the movements.” This exer-

cise of receptivity in the present moment induces practical engagement, something comparable to the Buddhist link between mindfulness, wisdom and compassion.

In the last section of his essay, the author explores the broader implications of a mindful application of the Rules for discerning the spirits to processes of collective and even corporate or institutional decisions and engagements. This brings us to such notions as "reciprocal, intersubjective mindfulness" and "corporate mindfulness". It would be interesting to check whether the Buddhist traditions (or the recent trends of 'engaged Buddhism') know any such broader understandings of mindfulness.

Even while drawing inspiration from Buddhist conceptions and practices of mindfulness, the author is well aware that many of his reflections and proposals have a singular Christian and even Ignatian ring: the "distinctively Ignatian form of mindfulness emphasizes explicit evaluation and judgment, an emphasis that sharply contrasts with the disclaimers we find in the Buddhist approach" (24).

Other Far Eastern Traditions

Luke SIM Jong-Hyeok s.j., *The Christological Vision of the* Spiritual Exercises *of St. Ignatius of Loyola and the Hermeneutical Principle of Sincerity (*Ch'eng*) in the Confucian Tradition*, Rome, Pontificia Universitas Gregoriana, 1992, xi-311 p.

In this doctoral dissertation submitted to the Faculty of theology, the aim of the Korean author is inculturation: "In order to develop a hermeneutical basis for an inculturated Christology in the Confucian context of Korea, one suggested approach is to study the notion of *ch'eng* [*cheng*] ('Sincerity') against the backdrop of Confucian tradition, and then to develop a hermeneutical system upon the investigation" (39). Among the Confucian Classics, the *Great Learning* (*Ta Hsüeh* [*Daxue*]) and the *Doctrine of the Mean* (*Chung Yung* [*Zhongyong*]) are the "two pivotal points" where the notion of Sincerity determines what it means to be a sage. Since the historical development of Chinese thought shows that this notion "provided a bridge between virtue-centered ancient Confucianism and metaphysically oriented Neo-Confucianism", both phases need to be studied in depth. Sincerity, truthfulness, authenticity, honesty, reality: '*ch'eng*' has cosmic and ethical, ontological and educational, epistemological and social-relational dimensions. Sincerity contributes to both balance and harmony; it includes self-knowledge, self-cultivation and the realization of Man's unity with Heaven.

This cultural-historical survey ends with a study of the role played by Sincerity, at the end of the 18th century, when a few Korean scholars, through their contacts at the Chinese court and capital city, discovered the Christian message and tried to interpret it. This encounter provides the transition to the second part of the dissertation.

The theologian's task is now to interpret anew the event of Jesus Christ in and for our contemporary situation. It is the author's conviction and challenge that "the development of the hermeneutic principle of Sincerity can serve this very purpose" and thus can be seen as "the basis for an Inculturated Christology" (162). 'Sincerity' implies that, in a dynamic way, the Word is understood as event, as realization. God's creative and salvific action is fully and dynamically manifested in the event of Christ – or what the

author calls the 'rhythm of Christ' – yesterday and today (132-133): everything comes from God in Christ, everything returns to God through Christ. The complete coming of the Kingdom of God is the full actualization of Sincerity (163).

These christological and theological perspectives are briefly outlined in the third chapter of the dissertation (121-163). In a fourth and longer one (164-219), the book of the *Spiritual Exercises*, with its formative pedagogy and its Christ-centred dynamism, has been selected as a testing ground to check the validity of *ch'eng* for a christology. "In fact, the originality of the *Spiritual Exercises* is found in its dynamic form, rather than in its content" (164). "We will focus on one specific aspect, the Christ-centered dynamism ('rhythm of Christ'), as it pertains both to each Week and the whole process of the Exercises" (164).

As a preamble, the Ignatian 'indifference' is examined in the light of the Confucian 'mean', that is "the state and quality of the human heart to be receptive to the Mandate of Heaven" (170-174), while the Ignatian formative prayer pedagogy is compared with the Confucian steps of learning. A short quotation from Mencius may give a hint of the way the full process of the four-week Exercises is then examined step by step: "He who exerts his mind to the utmost knows his nature. He who knows his nature knows Heaven. To preserve one's mind and to nourish one's nature is the way to serve Heaven" (187). Or, in the author's own words and in connection with the discernment of spirits: "In many ways, the language of Sincerity is the language of discernment of the movement of heart. In some sense, the notion of consolation or desolation has to do with one's sincerity of heart. What combines these two aspects of one's affectivity is the sincere intention to follow God's Will (Mandate of Heaven)" (210).

Jerome Emmanuel Dayrit GUEVARA, "A Daoist-Christian Integration of Physical, Mental, and Spiritual Exercises: *Tài jí* exercises of the Sword and the Ignatian Consciousness Examen", *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 14 (2012) 191-276.

From among the many Far Eastern martial arts, this essay concentrates on the Daoist-inspired sword exercises, leaving aside Buddhist-inspired disciplines since their origin is less purely Chinese. Could these *Tài jí* exercises help in the daily practice of the Ignatian Consciousness Examen and its five steps? Serious engagement with *Tài jí* exercises would of course include rigorous training in their successive stages: the external physical forms, the 'inner life force' and the 'spirit'.

The first chapter explores the traditional meaning of *Tài jí* in terms of the *Yîn* / *Yáng* polarity. Literally, *Tài jí* means Great Ultimate or Supreme Polarity; the author's preferred translation, 'Extreme Polarity', emphasizes "the importance of understanding polarities always in terms of pairs, that is, as paradoxes" (200). To quote from the classical scripture *Dào dé jîng* (§ 42): "The *Dào* generates the One, the One generates the Two, the Two generates the Three, the Three generates the Ten Thousand beings which bear the *Yîn*, yet all embrace the *Yáng*". Aside from being an exercise of the 'fist' (*quán*), *Tài jí* "is actually also a form of moving meditation on the *Dào* by experiencing the alternating roles of *Yîn* and *Yáng* in the body, mind and spirit" (202), this principle of *Yîn* and *Yáng* being "most obviously experienced in terms of emptiness and fullness

respectively" (202). Different schools propose particular routines or sets of exercises. In Ancient China, the practice of the sword (*Tài jí jiàn*) probably had "deep spiritual implications involving some form of spiritual warfare" within the spirit world and against the demons (204).

Chapter 2 attempts a Christian theological approach by first probing the various meanings of the sword in both the OT and the NT (more than 400 verses!), including its transformation or conversion, according to some messianic oracles, from violent death-dealing weapon to peaceful life-giving instrument. In the NT, while Jesus refuses to be defended by the sword, the double-edged sword becomes the symbol of the Word of God, a spiritual sword of discernment. Now, for Chinese Christians, there are good reasons suggesting to bring closer to each other the NT *Logos* and the *Dào* (some even translate the Johannine *'logos'* with the Chinese word '*dào*').

"Using *Tài jí* exercises as body prayer is an effective method for silencing and self-emptying. (...) After having emptied the mind and spirit of all distractions and focusing on God's presence, one proceeds to be filled by the Divine Word, the *Dào-Logos*" (234). After practicing for some time the *Tài jí* sets of movements to the accompaniment of scriptural (biblical) passages, one should be able to stop reciting them aloud and start meditating them in deep silence. *Tài jí quán* moves may thus be adapted or converted into new forms of Christian body prayer.

Coming back, in chapter 3, to the sword of the Word of God as an instrument for the discernment of spirits, the author connects *Tài jí* exercises and the examination of conscience. As explained in the *SpEx* (§ 43), the method for the examination of conscience includes five steps: giving thanks, asking the grace, giving an account of my soul, asking pardon, resolving to amend my faults. To foster sharper attention and awareness, particularly in group retreats, the five steps may be executed to the accompaniment of five chants. With or without chants, *Tài jí* moves may be selected and adapted to the five steps of the daily Ignatian Consciousness Examen: gratitude, petition of grace, review, contrition, action. After providing detailed examples, the author concludes that further studies could "explore the possibility of using other *Tài jí* exercises or other oriental prayer methods with other spiritual exercises, such as the full hour of meditation or contemplation" (249). – Several appendices include lists of Chinese terms, description of *Tài jí* moves and suggestions of Christian chants.

Sharing the Exercises with non-Christians?

Roger HAIGHT s.j., *Christian Spirituality for Seekers. Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola*, Maryknoll, Orbis Books, 2012, xxvii-291 p.

Besides comparisons between the world-views and teachings of the SpEx and those of the religious traditions of the East, besides the parallel or combined practice by Christians of the Ignatian methods of prayer and of Asian ways such as Yoga or Zen, there looms now and then another question. Whether in countries where Christians and indeed Catholics are a small minority or in (mostly Western) countries where many people have drifted away from a living Christian faith and not unfrequently feel attracted to

ignaziana
rivista di ricerca teologica

Eastern teachings and modes of meditation, a rather new phenomenon requires our attention: non-Christians or persons with no formal link to the Catholic Church are desirous to follow the path of the SpEx.

With the fast increasing geographical and cultural mobility and with the fluidity of unforeseeable and tentative personal itineraries, new types of persons may knock at the door of Ignatian spiritual centres. Roger Haight distinguishes several groups among those 'seekers', a term chosen for its "deliberate vagueness" (xvii). On the one hand, "people whose Christian faith has been eroded by post-modern culture". On the other hand, people who are not Christian "but are looking for... a source of enlightenment on the meaning of human life" (xxii). These may be "thoroughly secular" persons who have "never been exposed to religious sensibilities" or they may be members of other religious traditions: "today, Hindus, Buddhists, and Muslims living as neighbors in a large urban setting and approaching Jesus is as plausible as a Christian entering a Buddhist temple or a Hindu ashram" (xxiii).

Obviously, these situations differ widely and require appropriate responses from the persons who give the Exercises. The common point, however, is that "at any given time the desire for integral meaning may stimulate people to investigate or deepen their spirituality, understood as responsibility for one's life in the light of ultimacy" (xxiv). For those who have no faith commitment to Christ acknowledged as the Word of God, the strong point of the SpEx is the weight they give to meditating and contemplating the deeds and words of Jesus of Nazareth: a deep personal discovery of Jesus in his humanity, of Jesus as a teacher, a leader and guide or even a "fellow human traveler" (89), can operate a genuine spiritual transformation.

The same Jesus will "stimulate different receptions. Jesus of Nazareth is available to all as a spiritual teacher; but not all who approach him share the Christian narrative" (28). Without negating or excluding other dimensions, "the Christian spirituality proffered in this book appeals primarily to Jesus of Nazareth and secondarily to the Christian religion" (xxii). Haight's book thus tries to sail between the Scylla of the seeker and the Charybdis of the Christian (91). Appropriate adaptations are suggested, for instance, in connection with the Principle and Foundation (*SpEx* §§ 48-50), the Call of the earthly king (§§ 53-55), and particularly the Colloquy: "At this point certain spiritual seekers may hit a wall. How can seekers who have had no encounter with a personal God entertain such a colloquy?" (§ 95)

Roger Haight's 'Reflections' are mainly based on his experience of proposing the Exercises to Protestant Christians and in a secularized context. We quoted mostly from his Introduction since, in the body of his book, he has little to say specifically about exercitants coming forward from Hinduism, Buddhism or Islam.

Erin M. CLINE, *A World on Fire. Sharing the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises with Other Religions*, Washington, The Catholic University of America Press, 2018, xi-284 p.

The specific question of opening the Ignatian Exercises to persons of other religions is taken up by Erin Cline, a scholar of Chinese culture and religions, a philosopher and theologian at Georgetown University, a Protestant lady whose "life had been changed

by the profound experience [she] had with the Exercises" (ix). The focus is on persons making the "full and complete" four-week Exercises. And the method is not descriptive or sociological but rather both normative and practical: "Which elements of the Exercises can be fruitfully appropriated by non-Christians and in what ways...? What would it mean for non-Christians to 'share' the Exercises or to make particular dynamics of the Exercises their own?" (5)

More precisely, one would be well-advised to start from the first Annotation and the Principle and Foundation: "Is the kind of indifference that is central to the Exercises something that members of other religious traditions can embrace? Is the idea of seeking God's will for the ultimate end of salvation something that members of other traditions could affirm?" (29) There should be no problem for monotheists such as Jews or Muslims and even part of the Hindus. Buddhists of course and probably Daoists and others may not be comfortable with the idea of 'God'. Besides, Buddhists and some Hindus may be committed to eliminating desires completely while Ignatius believed that "God speaks to us through our desires" (35).

"Which members of other traditions should be chosen to make the Exercises? What should their motives and aims be? And *how* should the Exercises be given to them; that is, what kinds of adaptations should be made to the Exercises for members of other faiths?" (74) The challenge will be to maintain a double coherence. On the one hand, to fully respect the intention of persons who, without being or becoming Christian, expect from the experience of the SpEx a deepening of their own commitment. On the other hand, to fully respect the integrity of the global unfolding of the Exercises lest their specificity be watered down: on this point, Erin Cline has strong reservations concerning the essays by Roger Haight (42-50) as well as Ruben Habito (160, 181-183). Candidates should be "open to encountering God and exploring who Jesus Christ is" (82): being open of course does not mean being fully committed.

The SpEx booklet recommends adaptation to each single retreatant. In the case of non-Christians, new and more radical types of adaptation should be considered. But the temptation would be to proceed by way of subtraction, for instance dropping some meditations and other exercises or replacing them by material taken from the exercitant's own religious tradition: what benefit would he draw from that? One should avoid as much as possible this type of heavier adaptations. Instead of subtraction or substitution, the basic principle should be to offer supplemental resources drawn from the retreatant's own spiritual heritage. "Such a practice openly engages and seeks to address the exercitant's questions about and inevitable comparisons between her own tradition and that of Ignatius. (...) Careful comparative work can be an excellent resource here, for it provides signposts or markers that are designed to help exercitants of other faiths to better understand their own tradition as well as Christianity, and in the process, to deepen their faith" (105). Comparative theologians should be invited to prepare such supplemental resources. Their selection and use will be left at the discretion of the person who gives the Exercises. Care should be taken to avoid purely intellectual study or comparison.

In the better half of her book Erin Cline proceeds to apply those principles for exercitants of various religious origins. Leaving Judaism and Islam to better qualified

persons, she devotes two substantial chapters to Hinduism and Buddhism. Going through the full program of the four-week Exercises, she formulates recommendations and suggestions that take into account, as far as possible, the diversity of schools, teachings and practices. These chapters survey probable stumbling blocks on the way of the exercitants as well as points of easier understanding and resources intended to bridge the gaps. In the case of Hinduism, most of the themes and texts are taken from the Upanishads and the *Bhagavad-Gîtâ*: these scriptures may be taken as the hardcore of much of classical Hinduism.

Where Buddhism is concerned, the author has a separate treatment for more philosophical or purely non-theistic forms (Zen in particular) and another for more popular and devotional practices or beliefs which she boldly labels 'theistic'. The major hurdle is definitely the absence of 'God'. One should find out whether the Buddhist retreatant "is searching for an opportunity to contemplate, and even encounter, God and the life of Jesus deeply, for a considerable period of time. I stress here the importance of not just being *comfortable* with God and Jesus, but of *searching for an opportunity* to get acquainted with and even encounter God and Jesus; such a distinction is especially critical here, because there are no analogues to God in either philosophical or theistic forms of Buddhism." (175) In the absence of such a desire, a Buddhist retreat will probably be more useful than the Exercises.

In the last chapter – a survey of the Chinese cultural area – the author adopts a modified approach since most people share various syncretical forms of Confucian, Daoist and Buddhist traditions without identifying strictly with any of those.

2. Bibliography

*** = see **1. Reading Notes**

ACHARYA Kala, "The Spiritual Life of St. Francis Xavier in the Light of the Spiritual Exercises: A Comparative Study of the Christian and the Hindu Tradition", in Carlos MATA & Kala ACHARYA (eds), *St. Francis Xavier: His Times and Legacy*, Mumbai, Somaiya, 2007, 15-28. [by a Hindu author; see also NAMJOSHI.]

ALÈS Jean Régis d', « Magreb y espiritualidad ignaciana. Diálogo con la diferencia », *Manresa* 68 / 4 (1996) 395-404. [interpreting a personal encounter with Maghreb Islam in the light of the SpEx, and looking at the Ignatian spirituality in the light of Islam.]

AMALADASS Anand, "The *Bhagavadgîtâ* as Basis for a Retreat", *Ignis* XVI / 1 = 101 (1987) 13-18.

AMALADASS Anand, "Spiritual Direction: an Indian Perspective", *Ignis* 131 (1992 / 1) 14-20. [acc. to the Vaishnava tradition of the 'Southist' school, esp. Pillai Lokacharya (13th c.)]

AMALADASS Anand, "Aesthetics and Ignatian Spirituality", *Ignis* 132 (1992 / 2) 73-80. [acc. to the Kashmir Śaiva school.]

*** AMALADOSS Michael, *Iñigo in India. Reflections on the Ignatian* Exercises *by an Indian disciple*, Anand, Gujarat Sahitya Prakash, 1992, xviii-120 p.

AMALADOSS Michael, "Ignatian Spirituality for Other Believers", *Ignis* 43 / 2 (2013) 69-72. ["We need... to develop packages that we can make available to all people of goodwill...

The real challenge is that we do not do this merely as an intellectual presentation of ideas, but as a method of spiritual practice integrating it with the imagination, light and sound, posture and breathing as Ignatius himself does."]

AMA SAMY, "Can the Spiritual Exercises Lead us on to Zen Meditation?", *Jîvan* [Jesuits in India Views and News], August 2002, 4-10.

AMA SAMY, "The Exercises, Zen and Other Ways", *Ignis* 32 / 1 (2003) 38-43.

*** AMA SAMY, "Ignatianische Exerzitien und Zen-Meditation (Geistliche Ansprachen vor indischen Ordensleuten)", *Geist und Leben* 79 / 5 (2006) 360-374 [I]; 79 / 6 (2006) 440-457 [II].

AMA SAMY, "The Jesuit Blindness. The Crisis Jesuits Will Not Face", *The Way* 46 / 4 (2007) 127-140. [a brief presentation of some of the points treated in his 2006 articles.]

ARRUPE Pedro, "The Path to Christ. Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises (Hiroshima, 1949)", vol. I, in *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org], special number, 2021, 169 p. [translated from the Japanese original; while endeavouring to present these instructions and reflections in a Japanese context and idiom, there is no explicit attempt to compare with or draw inspiration from Buddhism or other Far Eastern traditions.]

BAATZ Ursula, "Hugo M. Enomiya-Lassalle: Zen Enlightenment and Christianity", in Robert A. MARYKS (ed.), *A Companion to Jesuit Mysticism*, Leiden, Brill, 2017, 335-357.

BALLESTER Mariano, "Métodos orientales del control respiratorio y tercer modo de orar ignaciano », *Manresa* 54 (1982) 167-174.

BALLESTER Mariano, *Ejercicios y métodos orientales*, Rome, Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis, 1985, 114 p. [I. The import of the body in meditation: food, sleep; yoga postures suitable for each of the four Weeks; Eastern ways of breath control (particularly in Hesychasm) and the third way of praying (§ 258); II. The role of guided imagination or visualization (§§ 112 etc.) compared to Pure Land Buddhism and Tibetan *chöd* meditation; the use of tales, stories or parables (§§ 2; 102; etc.).]

BALLESTER Mariano, « Una lectura corporal de los Ejercicios », *Manresa* 61 / 2 (1989) 147-159. [the place of the body in the SpEx; suggestions of body postures (mostly yoga *âsana*) suitable for the four Weeks.]

BARNES Michael, "The Spiritual Exercises: A Zen Perspective", *The Way Supplement* 55 (1986) 89-99. ["Spiritualities are differentiated both by their vision of the goal of the spiritual life and by the relative emphasis which they put on various practices, the way they seek to order the movement towards the desired goal. The object of this article is to explore something of this tension as it arises in the Spiritual Exercises and, by noting some points of comparison with Buddhism, especially in the zen tradition, to suggest how it may be resolved." (89)]

BARNES Michael, "The Body in the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola", *Religion* 19 / 3 (1989) 263-273. ["This article summarises and comments on references to the body in the text of the Exercises and... focuses on the last exercises in the book – the three methods of prayer."]

BARNES Michael, "With God in the World. A Dialogue between the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* and the *Spiritual Exercises*", in Catherine CORNILLE (ed.), *Song Divine. Christian Commentaries on the Bhagavad Gîtâ* (= Christian Commentaries on Non-Christian Sacred Texts 1), Leuven, Peeters / Dudley, Eerdmans, 2006, 91-112.

BAUBERGER Stefan, "Ignatian Spirituality and the Practice of Zen", *Ignis* 28 / 2 (1999) 62-69.

BAUBERGER Stefan, *Der Weg zum Herzgrund. Zen und die Spiritualität der Exerzitien* (= Ignatianische Impulse 42), Würzburg, Echter, 2010, 80 p. [what they can learn from each

other. See esp. ch. 4 "Die Mitte des Dialogs: Nicht-Selbst und ignatianische Abtötung"; ch. 5 "Herbst und Frühling – Die vierte Woche der Exerzitien".]

*** BESSE Léon, *La pratique des Exercices de saint Ignace dans l'ancienne Mission du Maduré* (= Collection de la Bibliothèque des Exercices de St Ignace 25), Enghien, Bibliothèque des Exercices / Paris, Lethielleux, 1910, 45 p. [based mainly on letters and reports by Fr. Charles-Michel Bertoldi and Constant-Joseph Beschi, 1719-1731.]

BRANTSCHEN Niklaus, "Zazen und Christusnachfolge. Überlegungen aus persönlicher Erfahrung" in Günter STACHEL (Hrsg), *munen musô, Ungegenständliche Meditation. FS für Pater Hugo M. Enomiya-Lassalle SJ zum 80. Geburtstag*, Mainz, Matthias-Grünewald, 1978, 430-437. [some reflections about his 'Tertianship' (1976) with Fr. Lassalle at Shinmeikutsu.]

BRÜCK Michael von, "Christliche Mystik und Zen-Buddhismus: Synkretistische Zugänge", *in* Wolfgang GREIVE & Raul NIEMANN (Hrsg.), *Neu Glauben? Religionsvielfalt und neue religiöse Strömungen als Herausforderung an das Christentum*, Gütersloh, Gütersloher Verlagshaus Gerd Mohn, 1990, 146-166. [the relations between Christian mysticism and Zen meditation as illustrated by the evolution of Fr. Lassalle's experience and the development of his reflections.]

BRÜCK Michael von, "Hugo Makibi Enomiya-Lassalle – Ergänzung der Religionen oder neues Bewußtsein?", in Michael von BRÜCK & Whalen LAI, *Buddhismus und Christentum. Geschichte, Konfrontation, Dialog*, München, Beck, 1997, pp. 502-516 + 739-741.

CATRET Juan, « ¿ Dar Ejercicios espirituales con 'paradojas biblicas' ? A la luz de la 'espiritualidad oriental' : los 'koan' del zen-budismo japonés », *Manresa* 65 / 1 (1993) 63-77. [investigating the meaning, history, use and fruit of the *kôan* as a help to shift the prayer of the SpEx from the head to the heart, and from the heart to the *hara* (69).]

CATTOI Thomas, "Reading Religious Texts Interreligiously. A Joint Exploration of Śântideva's *Bodhicaryâvatâra* and Ignatius's *Exercises*", [summary in] *CTSA* [Catholic Theological Society of America] *Proceedings* 69 (2014) 116-117. [**https://ejournals.bc.edu/index.php/ctsa/article/view/5544/5007**]

CATTOI Thomas, "Reading Ignatius in Kathmandu: Toward a New Pedagogy of Interreligious Dialogue", in Marc A. PUGLIESE & Alexander Y. HWANG (eds.), *Teaching Interreligious Encounters* (= AAR Teaching Religious Studies Series), New York, Oxford University Press, 2017, pp. 208-219.

CHAMPAGNE René, « [Chronique ignatienne] Zazen à Loyola », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* 105 (2003 / 1) 97-107. [A "Zen & Gospel" retreat given by B. Senécal at La Pairelle, Belgium, June 21-29, 2002.]

CHAMPAGNE René, « [Chronique ignatienne] Jésuites à la rencontre du bouddhisme », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* 114 (2005) 113-127. [Francis Xavier and Cosme de Torrès; Hugo M. Enomiya-Lassalle and Aloysius Pieris.]

CHANG C., *Essai d'une adaptation des Exercices spirituels à l'âme chinoise*, Rome, Pontificia Universitas Gregoriana, 1952, 31 p. [extract from doctoral dissertation.]

*** CLINE Erin M., *A World on Fire. Sharing the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises with Other Religions*, Washington, The Catholic University of America Press, 2018, xi-284 p. [see review by SCHEUER 2018.]

*** CLOONEY Francis X., "God for us. Multiple Religious Identities as a Human and Divine Prospect", in Catherine CORNILLE (ed.), *Many Mansions? Multiple Religious Belonging and Christian Identity*, Maryknoll, Orbis, 2002, pp. 44-60.

CLOONEY Francis X., "The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius Loyola: Comparative Perspectives from Asia and the West", *Pacific Rim Report* (University of San Francisco) 41 (June

2006). [reprinted as "Learning to Learn Interreligiously: In Light of the *Spiritual Exercises* of St. Ignatius of Loyola", *Asian Christian Review* 2 / 1 (2008) 67-83.]

CLOONEY Francis X., "Finding God in All Things: Some Catholic and Hindu Insights", *Vinayasadhana. Dharmaram Journal of Psycho-Spiritual Formation* (Bangalore) 7 / 1 (January 2016) 30-44.

CLOONEY Francis X., "The Ignatian 'Repetitio', One-Pointedness, and Interreligious Learning", *Ignis* 46 / 4 (2016) 24-44.

COLOMBO Emanuele, "Defeating the Infidels, Helping Their Souls. Ignatius Loyola and Islam", in: Robert Aleksander MARYKS (ed.), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola. Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, Leiden, Brill, 2014, pp. 178-197. [in particular pp. 192-194 "Spiritual Exercises for Muslims": Nadal's *Apologia*.]

COUTINHO Paul, "The Ignatian Ideal Through Śankara's *Vivekachudamani*: 'Crest-Jewel of Discernment'", *Ignis* 33 / 4 (2004) 1-6.

DELBECQ Andre & Len TISCHLER, "Using the *Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola* as a Basis for a Buddhist-Christian Retreat", *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 35 (2015) 213-217.

DE MELLO Anthony, *Seek God Everywhere. Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius* (edited by Gerald O'Collins, Daniel Kendall & Jeffrey LaBelle), New York, Doubleday / Image Books, 2010, 199 p. [contains however very little on India or Hinduism except from a final section on "Gandhi's Vision".]

DE SMET Richard, "Indian Roots for the Lord–Vassal Relationship in the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius", *Ignis Studies* II / 6–7 (June-Sept. 1984) 5-39. [The European Lord–Vassal Relationship; The Christ-Image of the Exercises; The Indian Parallel of the Lord–Vassal Relationship.] [First published in DE MEULDER E. (ed.), *When Two Great Hearts Meet*, Allahabad, St Paul Publications, 1976, pp. 192-220; reprinted in *Indian Journal of Spirituality* 6 (1993) 191-206, 294-321.]

DE SMET Richard, "The Exercises in India: an Early Ignatian Revival", *Ignis* 128 (1991 / 4) 191-198. [vicissitudes of the SpEx among the missionaries of the old Society: Jerome Xavier, De Nobili, Carolo Bertoldi, Costanzo Beschi...]

DHANARAJ, "Nammazhvar and the Contemplation to Attain Love", *Ignis* 28 / 3 (1999) 16-20. [Nammazhvar or Nammalvar (8th century?), one among twelve famous Tamil devotees of Vishnu and poet-saints.]

DURAJ Jarosław, "Zen-Ignatian Training Program in Japan: A Personal Experience" in VELIATH Cyril (ed.), *The Wheel & the Cross. An Anthology by Jesuits & Friends on Buddhism and Dialogue*, Phnom Penh, MAGGA Jesuit Research Center (on behalf of Jesuit Conference of Asia Pacific), 2021, pp. 1-23 [full text at **https://jcapsj.org/wp-content/uploads/1/2021/12/The-Wheel-The-Cross.pdf**]. [a description and evaluation of the "International Zen-Ignatian training program for selected Catholic Spiritual leaders to deepen Christian Spirituality (especially the Spiritual Exercises)" offered by Fr. K. Kadowaki, August 2006 and 2007.]

DY Ari [Aristotle] C. (ed.), *The Pilgrim and the Sage: Ignatian Spirituality and Buddhism in Dialogue*, Pasig City (Philippines), Anvil Publishing, 2019, 211 p. [an anthology of Jesuit writings on Ignatius and Buddhism: M. Amaladoss, Ama Samy, M. Barnes, J. [Jerry] Cusumano, K. Kadowaki, J. Melloni, D. O'Hanlon, A. Pieris, B. Senécal + (non-S.J.) J. Whitaker.]

EDWIN Victor, "Spiritual Crisis in the Lives of al-Ghazali and Ignatius of Loyola", *Ignis* 32 / 1 (2003) 44-57. [covers more ground than the sole SpEx.]

ENOMIYA [sic] Hugo M., *Zen-Buddhismus*, Köln, Bachem, 1966, pp. 318-329 "Die Exerzitien des heiligen Ignatius von Loyola". [the mystical dimension of the SpEx; some points

of comparison with Zen: ‘indifference’, objectless meditation, rules of behaviour during a *sesshin*, personal spiritual guidance...]

*** ENOMIYA-LASSALLE Hugo M., *Zazen und die Exerzitien des heiligen Ignatius. Einübung in das wahre Dasein*, Köln, Bachem, 1975, 86 p.

ENOMIYA-LASSALLE Hugo M., “The Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius of Loyola and Zen”, in T.M.P. MAHADEVAN (ed.), *Spiritual Perspectives. Essays in Mysticism and Metaphysics,* New Delhi, Arnold-Heinemann, 1975, pp. 197-211.

ENOMIYA-LASSALLE Hugo M.: see also BAATZ 2017; BRANTSCHEN 1978; von BRÜCK 1990, 1997; CHAMPAGNE 2005; LÓPEZ CASQUETE 2021.

EVERS Georg, “Personal Reflections on Mysticism in Christianity and Buddhism”, in John O’GRADY and Peter SCHERLE (eds.), *Ecumenics from the Rim. Explorations in Honour of John D’Arcy May*, Berlin, LIT Verlag, 2007, pp. 215-220. [more precisely: Ignatius of Loyola and Zen Buddhism: “finding God in all things” and “Buddha-nature”.]

FELDMEIER Peter, *Experiments in Buddhist-Christian Encounter. From Buddha-Nature to the Divine Nature*, Maryknoll, Orbis, 2019, ix-261 p., ch. 6 “The Way of the Bodhisattva and the Spiritual Exercises”, pp. 117-138. [Ignatius and Śântideva: personal salvation and salvation of the whole world; humility and confidence; see also pp. 163-164.]

FENOYL Maurice de, « Propos de soufis. Mystique musulmane et Exercices spirituels de saint Ignace », *Archivo Teológico Granadino* 81 (2018) 9-70. [“This compilation of Sufi texts sets in relation Saint Ignatius’ Spiritual Exercises with the diverse expressions of the Muslim spirituality. Taking into account that the selection of the author comprises fourteen centuries, its interest is not so much genealogical but comparative.” (9)]

FEYS John M., “Indifference: Ignatius of Loyola – Teilhard de Chardin – the Gita”, *Ignis Studies* II / 6-7 (June-Sept. 1984) 40-71. [“The *Gita* does give an importance to non-attachment which contradicts the subordinate position of indifference in Ignatian spirituality. Is the *Gita*’s detachment negative to the extent of deserving Teilhard’s disavowal: is it a detachment of ’withdrawal’? No doubt, action *is* done by virtue of *svadharma*. But while the Gita rises in detachment above all matter, it does not raise it to the level of spirit. Lastly, the detachment of the *Gita*, no more than the indifference of the *Exercises*, is not ultimate: *bhakti*... is.” (69-70)]

FLÓREZ Generoso M., « Un experimento de Ejercicios a no cristianos », *Manresa* 61 / 3 (1989) 283-293. [giving the SpEx to teachers and other staff of Catholic schools, colleges and universities in Japan: the majority of them, in some cases up to 98%, are non-Christians.]

FUNG Jojo M., “Sacred Time for a Sacred Sojourn in the Mystical Age”, *Ignis* 43 / 4 (2013) 7-32. [a Malaysian-Chinese Jesuit, Fr. Fung spent more than two decades with the indigenous peoples of South-East Asia, in conversation with indigenous elders, healers, sages and shamans.]

GARCÍA CASTENEDO José María, « Poesía de Tagore y ‘Ejercicios Espirituales’ », *Manresa* 56 / 2 (1984) 167-178. [a selection of Tagore’s poems suitable for the four Weeks of the SpEx.]

GARCÍA-HUIDOBRO Tomás, « Kakichi Kadowaki : L’inculturazione del cristianesimo nella cultura giapponese », *La Civiltà Cattolica* n° 4037 (2018 / III) 415-425 ; « Kakichi Kadowaki et l’inculturation du christianisme dans la culture japonaise », *La Civiltà Cattolica* [French ed.], June 2020.

GISPERT-SAUCH George, “*Viveka*: Discernment in the Indian Tradition”, *Ignis* XVI / 3 = 103 (1987) 115-118.

GISPERT-SAUCH George, “*Viveka*: Discernment according to Śankara”, *Ignis* XVI / 4 = 104 (1987) 171-175.

GISPERT-SAUCH George, “Experiencing the Deeper Self”, *Ignis* 33 / 2 (2004) 36-45. [a presentation of the SpEx and a guided ‘Contemplation to Attain Love’ given to a gathering organized by the Foundation for Universal Responsibility of His Holiness the Dalai Lama.]

GISPERT-SAUCH George, “The Monk Bodhisattva and the Reader Iñigo”, *Ignis* 39 / 4 (2008) 14-21.

GREGSON Vernon, “Chinese Wisdom and Ignatian Discernment”, *Review for Religious* 33 / 4 (1974) 828-835. [about the *I Ching* or *Yi Jing*, the *Book of Changes* or *Classic of Changes*.]

GUÉRIN Guilbert, *Une pratique pastorale des Exercices spirituels en Asie orientale*, Montréal, Guérin, 1995-1999, 3 vol. [Since 1953, the author animates spiritual retreats in Taiwan and the Far East. This is the French-language version of an oral practice, mostly in Mandarin Chinese.]

GUÉRIN Guilbert, « Quelques remarques sur la direction des Exercices spirituels à Taïwan », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* n° 95 (2000 / 3) 183-191. [I. General observations about the Chinese culture. II. Specific observations about particular topics in the SpEx.]

*** GUEVARA Jerome Emmanuel Dayrit, “A Daoist-Christian Integration of Physical, Mental, and Spiritual Exercises: *Tai ji* exercises of the Sword and the Ignatian Consciousness Examen”, *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 14 (2012) 191-276.

*** HABITO Ruben L.F., *Zen and the Spiritual Exercises. Paths of Awakening and Transformation*, Maryknoll, Orbis, 2013, xxv-237 p.

HAHNENFELD M.T., *An Exposition of the Buddha’s Way of Mindfulness and of the First Phase of the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius*, Rome, Pont. Ist. Regina Mundi, diss., 1975.

*** HAIGHT Roger, *Christian Spirituality for Seekers. Reflections on the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola*, Maryknoll, Orbis Books, 2012, xxvii-291 p.

HAND Thomas G., *Always a Pilgrim. Walking the Zen Christian Path*, Burlingame (CA), Mercy Center Meditation Program, 2004, 224 p. [“shares his own spiritual pilgrimage – both experientially and from a philosophical/theological perspective.”]

*** HARNACK Edgar W., “Vom fernen Nächsten lernen. Ignatianische Exerzitien und tibetisches Tantra im Vergleich”, *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie* 132 / 2 (1974) 182-199.

*** HOSTEN H., *Le P. Huby aux Indes, ou Le Miroir de l’âme chez les Protestants. Étude précédée de divers documents* (= Collection de la Bibliothèque des Exercices de St Ignace 33), Enghien, Bibliothèque des Exercices, 1911, 46 p. [about several translations or adaptations of Huby’s *Mirror of the Heart* published by Protestant missionaries in Indian languages.]

IPARRAGUIRRE Ignacio, « Los Ejercicios Espirituales Ignacianos, el método misional de San Francisco Javier y la misión jesuítica de la India en el siglo XVI », *Studia Missionalia* 5 (1950) 3-43.

IPARRAGUIRRE Ignacio, *Historia de los Ejercicios de San Ignacio*, vol. II (= Bibliotheca Instituti Historici S.I. VII), Roma, Institutum Historicum S.I. / Bilbao, Mensajero, 1955, pp. 201-212. [India 201-207; China 208-209; Japan 209-212.]

IRUDAYARAJ Xavier, “Indo-Ignatian Satsangh”, *Ignis* IV / 5 = 29 (1975) 2-8; “Sin and Conversion: Indo-Ignatian Views and Experiences”, *Ignis* VI / 5 = 41 (1977) 12-19; “Igna-

tian and Indian Methods of Prayer", *Ignis* VII / 6 = 48 (1978) 2-8; "The Exercises and Social Change in India Today", *Ignis* VIII / 5 = 53 (1979) 8-15; "Unity – Vision of God, Man and Nature. Indo-Ignatian Spirituality in a Retreat Atmosphere", *Ignis* X / 6 = 66 (1981) 16-18; "Socially Oriented Retreats", *Ignis* XV / 3 = 93 (1986) 5-11. [reports of meetings of the Indo-Ignatian Satsang(h) group of Jesuits; "a search to relate and integrate Indian and Ignatian spiritualities in the context of India today".]

*** JOHNSTON William, *Mystical Journey. An Autobiography*, Maryknoll, Orbis Books, 2006, x-230 p.

JOSEPH Dunstan Vinny, "My Journey in Vipassana and the Spiritual Exercises", in VELIATH Cyril (ed.), *The Wheel & the Cross. An Anthology by Jesuits & Friends on Buddhism and Dialogue*, Phnom Penh, MAGGA Jesuit Research Center (on behalf of Jesuit Conference of Asia Pacific), 2021, pp. 89-97 [full text at **https://jcapsj.org/wp-content/uploads/1/2021/12/The-Wheel-The-Cross.pdf**]. [focus on how the stages in Vipassana meditation roughly correspond to the stages of Purification, Illumination and Union in the SpEx.]

KADOWAKI Kakichi, *The Ignatian Exercises and Zen: An Attempt at Synthesis*, Jersey City (N.J.), PASE [Program to Adapt the Spiritual Exercises], s.a. [1974?], 21 p. [see O'HANLON 1978, p. 741 n. 12: "21-page offprint without indication of when or where published. This is the description of Fr. Kadowaki's experiments using Zen techniques in directing the Spiritual Exercises."]

*** KADOWAKI J.K. [Kakichi], *Zen and the Bible. A Priest's Experience*, London / Boston, Routledge and Kegan Paul, 1980, xii-180 p.

ADOWAKI Kakichi, "Mit dem Körper lesen: Paulus und Dôgen" in Hans WALDENFELS & Thomas IMMOOS (Hrsg.), *Fernöstliche Weisheit und christlicher Glaube* (FS Dumoulin), Mainz, Matthias-Grünewald, 1985, pp. 68-78.

KADOWAKI Kakichi, « La contribution du Zen à une meilleure compréhension et une meilleure pratique des Exercices spirituels », in Pierre GERVAIS (dir.), *La pratique des Exercices spirituels d'Ignace de Loyola. Actes du Symposium de Bruxelles 1991* (= Collection IET, 11), Bruxelles, Éditions de l'Institut d'Études Théologiques, 1991, pp. 69-86. [see also p. 265 : Atelier 21 : K. Kadowaki, « La méditation Zen appliquée à la prière chrétienne ».]

KADOWAKI J. Kakichi, *Aliento de Vida y Luz del Camino. El Espíritu, intérprete de la Palabra*, Madrid, San Pablo Editorial, 2020, 192 p. [posthumous publication edited by Juan Masiá and Pedro Vidal on the basis of 2015-2016 recordings of retreat meditations (Spiritual Exercises) and of personal notes.]

KADOWAKI Kakichi: see also DURAJ 2021; GARCÍA-HUIDOBRO 2018, 2020; LÓPEZ CASQUETE 2021; SENÉCAL 2008.

KÄMPCHEN Martin: see PUTHIADAM Ignatius & Martin KÄMPCHEN 1980.

KANTHARAJ John Pradeep, *Ignatian* Spiritual Exercises *and Eastern Prayer Methods. Interfaith Dialogue and Practice*, Madrid, Universidad Pontificia Comillas, Instituto Universitario de Espiritualidad, 2016, vii-114 p. [Yoga, Nâma Japa, Zen.] [diss. lic. theol.; full text available at **https://repositorio.comillas.edu/**]

KANTHARAJ John Pradeep ["John Pradeep K."], "Ignatian Spiritual Exercises and Eastern Prayer Methods. Dialogue and Practice", *Ignis* 49 / 1 (2019) 5-27. [SpEx and Yoga, Nâmajapa, Zen: points of convergence or divergence; practicing Yoga, Nâmajapa and Zen during the Ignatian Exercises.]

KENNEDY S. John, *Rekindling the Role of Affectivity in Ignatian Discernment of Spirits in the Context of Christian Life Communities in Darjeeling, India*, Santa Clara University, Jes-

uit School of Theology, diss., 2017, iv-101 p. [full text at **https://scholarcommons.scu.edu/jst_dissertations/23**] ["...lack of affectivity in decision making... traced from their former religious practices of immediately appeasing spirits by offering material things through village priests..."]

KÖRNER Felix, "Salvific Community. Part One: Ignatius of Loyola" & "Salvific Community. Part Two: the Koran", *Gregorianum* 94 / 3 (2013) 593-609, 94 / 4 (2013) 757-772. [republished in *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org], numero speciale [2019]: Rossano Zas Friz De Col (ed.), "Prospettive teologiche e filosofiche sulla tradizione ignaziana in *Gregorianum* (2013-2018)", 145-161, 162-177.] [comparative theological anthropology, partly based on the Sp. Ex.]

KUNZ Sandra Costen, *Sustaining Redemptive Social Action: Intertwining Zen and Ignatian Meditation for Christian Discernment*, ProQuest, UMI Dissertation Publishing, 2011, 468 p. ["This dissertation proposes a method for Christian congregations and institutions of higher education to teach skills for nonviolent cultural transformation. (...) I examine and test the hypothesis that Zen practices for increasing the accuracy of one's perceptions, and Ignatian practices that center the imagination in biblical narratives, mutually support discernment."]

KWON Yon-dahm, "Chinul's Empty and Quiescent Spiritual Knowing (*kongjok yongji*) and Ignatius of Loyola's Indifference and Discernment of Spirits", *Journal of Korean Religions* 10 / 2 (2019) 183-220. [reprinted in VELIATH Cyril (ed.), *The Wheel & the Cross. An Anthology by Jesuits & Friends on Buddhism and Dialogue*, Phnom Penh, MAGGA Jesuit Research Center (on behalf of Jesuit Conference of Asia Pacific), 2021, pp. 25-54; full text at **https://jcapsj.org/wp-content/uploads/1/2021/12/The-Wheel-The-Cross.pdf**]. ["For Chinul (1158-1210), when through flawless detachment one's mind essence and function reach a point of complete harmony, one achieves perfect empty quiescent spiritual knowing. For Ignatius, when through perfect indifference one's will becomes one with God's, one can discern His will without fail."]

LECLEIR Stefaan, "Gebed en dialoog – inculturatie en verkondiging. Over de Geestelijke Oefeningen van de H. Ignatius en de evangelisatie van jezuïeten in China », *Internationaal Katholiek Tijdschrift Communio* 29 / 1 (2004) 66-79. ["Prayer and Dialogue – Inculturation and Proclamation. About the Spiritual Exercises and the Evangelisation by the Jesuits in China" (17th – 18th c.] [prayer as an important source of proclamation; the mode of prayer influences the way the Gospel is proclaimed.]

LIM Hon-ok Gabriel, « 'Emptiness' in Buddhism and in the Spiritual Exercises. An Approach to Interreligious Dialogue and Spirituality", *Spirituality* (Dublin) 7 (2001).

LOMBA FUENTES Joaquín, « Espiritualidad y humanismo. Dos tesoros de la espiritualidad del pasado : Ibn Paqûda e Ignacio de Loyola », in AMIGO FERNANDEZ de ARROYABE María Luisa (dir.), *Humanismo para el siglo XXI : Propuestas para el Congreso Internacional*, Bilbao, Universidad de Deusto, 2003, pp. 471-477.

LOPETEGUI León, « Eco de los 'Ejercicios' en las cartas y escritos de Javier », *Siglo de las misiones* 39 (1952) 429-437.

LÓPEZ CASQUETE Manuel, « Zen y Ejercicios espirituales. ¿ Podemos vivir la experiencia de los Ejercicios desde los modos propios del Zen ? », *Manresa* 84 / 2 (2012) 169-182. [historical context: Fr. Lassalle's itinerary; "basically, the methodology of the Exercises has a cataphatic content while Zen is clearly apophatic; in spite of that, Zen can make immensely rich contributions to Ignatian spirituality, both in daily prayer and in the specific experience of the Exercises".]

LÓPEZ CASQUETE Manuel, "Zen Buddhism and Ignatian Spirituality", *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 41 (2021) 261-278. [the story of an encounter (esp. H.M. Enomiya-Lassalle & K.

Kadowaki); SpEx and Buddhist meditation: are they compatible or not? "...the encounter between *zazen* and Ignatian Spiritual Exercises can offer a marvelous way of union between *apophatic* and *cataphatic* prayer". (275)]

LOTZ Johannes Baptist, "Weg der Befreiung: die Erfahrung des Ostens im Licht der ignazianischen Exerzitien", *Stimmen der Zeit* 193 / 9 (1975) 579-594.

LOTZ Johan [sic ; Johannes Baptist], « Le chemin menant à la libération d'après l'expérience spirituelle de l'Orient, à la lumière des Exercices Spirituels de S. Ignace », *Recherches ignatiennes* (Rome, Curia gen. S.I.) 2 (1975) ; reprint in *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* n° 1 (janvier-mars 1977) 19-40. [I. The path of the SpEx. II. The path of Zen. With emphasis on the common points. *Kenosis* of the mind and opening onto a transobjective dimension; human endeavour and divine grace]

LUÉVANO Rafael, "Catholic Discernment with a View of Buddhist Internal Clarity", *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 29 (209) 39-51. [spiritual decision-making processes in the Catholic (Ignatian discernment) and Theravâda Buddhist traditions: aims, means, outcome.]

MADIGAN Dan, "Islam", in: José GARCÍA de CASTRO (dir.), *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana* (= Colección Manresa 37-38), Bilbao, Mensajero / Santander, Sal Terrae, 2007, pp. 1046-1050. [Ignatius and Islam; Ignatian spirituality today and Islam.]

*** MALPAN Varghese, *A Comparative Study of the Bhagavad-Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius of Loyola on the Process of Spiritual Liberation* (= Documenta Missionalia 22), Roma, Editrice Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 1992, 442 p.

MALPAN Varghese, "Bhakti-Yoga of the Bhagavad-Gîtâ and the Ignatian Contemplation to Attain Love"; *Ignis* 38 / 2 (2008) 16-31.

MARANDU Melchior, *Ignatian Discernment : An African Perspective*, Nairobi, Paulines Publications Africa, 2013, 104 p.

MARZAL Manuel M., « Inculturación y diálogo interreligioso a la luz de la espiritualidad ignaciana », *Diakonia* (Nicaragua) n° 64 (1992) 65-84. [also in: *Ignatian Spirituality in Jesuit Apostolate*, Rome, Centrum Ignatianum Spiritualitatis, 1992, pp. 255-275.] [how should we give the Exercises in inculturated ways both to persons who live their Catholicism according to diverse 'spiritualities' in an ever more pluralist Church as well as to persons of different religious traditions in a world ever more conscious of its religious plurality and demanding dialogue and mutual respect?]

MASIÁ CLAVEL Juan, « Deseo y quietud. Notas para reinterpretar desde Japón dos palabras ignacianas », *Manresa* 44 / 3 (1972) 285-294. [desire and peace of mind: "it is possible, around these two words, to gather together the active and the contemplative traits of Ignatius... Reading them in the Japanese context helped me interpreting them in the light of dialogue between the Ignatian spirituality and Japan." (286)]

MASIÁ Juan, « Contrición y gratitud. (Sobre la Primera Semana de los Ejercicios en contexto japonés) », *Manresa* 46 / 4 (1974) 291-300. ["the question of the Christian meaning of sin and its Japanese expression, particularly adequate formulations of the manifestation of repentance and of the feeling of gratitude for forgiveness."]

MASIÁ Juan, "Negarse y realizarse", *Manresa* 47 / 1 (1975) 41-46. [a reading of the Ignatian Second Week, particularly § 189, compared with Dôgen's *Shôbôgenzô*: "the way toward enlightenment is to discover oneself; to meet oneself, one has to forget oneself; by forgetting oneself, one becomes transparent to everything".]

MASIÁ CLAVEL Juan, "Para dejarse alcanzar... – Contemplaciones orientales », *Manresa* 68 / 1 (1996) 17-33. ["On the basis of the initial intuition that 'obtaining love' is possible only through the experience of 'having been reached by love', and in order to deepen this experience, the author uncovers six traits of the Eastern – concretely Japanese –

culture that open new understandings of and new accesses to the Christian contemplation of the God who dwells in his creatures". (17)]

MASIÁ Juan, "Corpóreo-espiritualidad oriental", *Manresa* 74 / 3 (2002) 265-270. ["Both the tradition of commentaries on the Exercises and the way of giving them have often emphasized the dimensions of activity and spirituality rather than receptivity and corporeity. The contribution of Eastern traditions helps us rediscover that spirituality has to be 'corporeal-spirituality' and that 'radical receptivity' should be at the basis of contemplative life." (265)]

MEJÍA Jorge Julio, ¿ Que puede aportar el Zen a la experiencia de los Ejercicios espirituales ignacianos ?, *Apuntes Ignacianos* 12 / n° 34 (2002) 73-96. **https://eduignaciana.tripod.com/docum/zen.pdf** [Zen meditation helps develop the 'interior knowledge' (*SpEx* § 104), the 'heart', the inner silence. It is thus a fitting preparation for the contemplation of the life of Christ according to the Gospels and the Exercises.]

MELLONI Javier, « *Exercices Spirituels* et spiritualité orientale : Convergences et problèmes », in *Actualité de la mystique ignatienne. Colloque 20 & 21 octobre 2000* (= Cahiers de Spiritualité 1), Paris, Médiasèvres, 2001, pp. 51-64. [Note however that 'oriental' here means almost exclusively the Christian East.]

MELLONI Javier, "The Spiritual Exercises and the Spirituality of the East", *The Way Supplement* 103 (2002) 55-65. [the 'East' here refers to "the spiritual way characteristic of the Christian East, the hesychastic way of devotion to the name of Jesus, and of nondiscursive, imageless prayer." (55)]

*** MELLONI Javier, *The Exercises of St Ignatius of Loyola and the Traditions of the East* (= Inigo Text Series 14), Leominster, Gracewing / New Malden, Inigo Enterprises, 2013, vii-66 p.

MELLONI RIBAS Javier, "Ignatian Spirituality and Buddhism", in: Robert Aleksander MARYKS (ed.), *A Companion to Ignatius of Loyola. Life, Writings, Spirituality, Influence*, Leiden, Brill, 2014, pp. 248-265. [Parallelisms between Ignatius and Buddha; Similarities between both doctrines; the Exercises and Zen; Differences: apophatic way / kataphatic way; Fertility of the encounter.]

*** MICHAEL Pavulraj, *Search and Find the Will of God. A Dialogue between the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius and the Bhagavad Gîtâ* (estratto), Rome, Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 2012, ii-230 p. [according to the catalogue of the PUG library, the full text of the dissertation covered about 575 p.]

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "*Nishkama Karma* and Active Indifference: A Dialogue Between the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* and the *Spiritual Exercises* of Ignatius", *Studies in Interreligious Dialogue* 23 (2013) 207-225.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "Hermeneutical Reading on the Understanding of God: A Dialogue between the Bhagavad Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius", *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 17 (2014) 80-103.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "*Mad-anugrahâya* and Divine Grace in the Bhagavad Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises", *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 22 (2016) 201-217.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "*Avatar* and Incarnation: Gîtâ Spirituality and Ignatian Spirituality at the Crossroads", *Gregorianum* 97 / 2 (2016) 323-342. [republished in *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org], numero speciale [2019]: Rossano Zas Friz De Col (ed.), "Prospettive teologiche e filosofiche sulla tradizione ignaziana in *Gregorianum* (2013-2018)", 178-197.]

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "Human Person in the Spiritual Exercises and the Bhagavad Gîtâ", *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 24 (2017) 216-233.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, "Finding God in All Things: A Dialogue Between the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* and the *Spiritual Exercises* of Ignatius", *Studies in Interreligious Dialogue* 28 / 1 (2018) 59-76.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, " '*Paramabhakti* and Intense Love of God': A Dialogue between the Bhagavad Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius", *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org] 26 (2018) 152-168.

MICHAEL Pavulraj, " 'Intense Love of God': A Dialogue between the Bhagavad Gîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius", *Asia Journal of Theology* 33 / 2 (2019) 93-109.

MOHAMMED Ovey N., "Ignatian Spirituality and the Bhagavad Gîtâ", *Thought* 62 (1987) 423-434.

MOHAMMED Ovey N., "Hinduism and Ignatian Spirituality", *The Way Supplement* 68 (1990) 112-124. ["This paper... highlights the similarities between the spirituality of action (*karma yoga*) found in the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* and the spirituality of action developed by Ignatius. (...) This paper traces the steps which Ignatius took to solve the problem of contemplation and action and relies mainly on the *Spiritual Exercises*... As each step is taken, the *Gîtâ* is examined to see if this step has a parallel in its own development." (113)]

MOLINA J. Michelle, "Spirituality and Colonial Governmentality: the Jesuit *Spiritual Exercises* in Europe and Abroad", in Patricia Clare INGHAM & Michelle R. WARREN (eds.), *Postcolonial Moves: Medieval through Modern,* New York, Palgrave Macmillan, 2003, pp. 133-152. ["This essay takes as its case study the Jesuit *Spiritual Exercises* to show one example of the making of 'modern selves' in a Catholic and colonial context. I discuss them in three settings. The first is Ignatius of Loyola's intentions when writing the *Exercises*... The second is the way that the *Exercises* informed the Jesuit evangelization practices in European cities and countrysides. The third is the way Jesuits used the *Exercises* in their missions..., primarily in India and New Spain." (134)]

MOORE Donald, "An Ignatian Perspective on Contemporary Jewish Spirituality", *Thought – Fordham University Quarterly* 67 / 4 (1992) 420-429; reprinted in: Thomas F. MICHEL (ed.), *Friends on the Way: Jesuits Encounter Contemporary Judaism*, New York, Fordham University Press, 2007, pp. 57-70. ["This chapter... explains the relevance and similarity of Jewish spirituality expounded by Jewish writers Martin Buber and Abraham Joshua Heschel to the Spiritual Exercises."]

MURALA Jagadish M., *Mystical Experience: Inter-religious Approach to Spiritual Exercises*, Delhi, ISPCK, 2011, 227 p. [see a rather critical review by P.R. John in *Vidyajyoti Journal of Theological Reflection* 76 / 2 (February 2012) 78-79.]

NADAL Jerónimo, "Exercises for Infidels, Heretics and Sinners", *The Way* 43 / 1 (2004) 43-50. [from Nadal's *Apology for the Exercises* in reaction to the Dominican theologian Tomás Pedroche (*Monumenta Nadal* 4.848-852): "...for all of these our Exercises can be accommodated, even for infidels... Meditations are to be added drawing on the law of nature and on the Catholic truths confessed by the infidel... Then the Elections are to be got across to them, tempered to what they can take..." (46-47)]

NAM Tien M., *Ignatian Spiritual Direction in the Vietnamese Context*, Berkeley, Jesuit School of Theology, 2007. [dissertation.]

NAMJOSHI Lalita, "The Experience of God in St. Francis Xavier under the Light of the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius", in Carlos MATA & Kala ACHARYA (eds), *St. Francis Xavier: His Times and Legacy*, Mumbai, Somaiya, 2007, pp. 29-38. [by a Hindu author; see also ACHARYA.]

NEUNER Josef, "Indischer und christlicher Gleichmut. Eine vergleichende Studie der Bhagavadgîtâ und der Ignatianischen Exerzitien", *Geist und Leben* 25 (1952) 439-457. [I. The parallels; II. The contrast; III. Practical assessment.]

NEUNER Josef, “Non-Attachment, Indian & Christian. A Comparative Study of the Bhagavadgîtâ and the Spiritual Exercises of St. Ignatius”, *The Clergy Monthly Missionary Supplement* 2 / n° 3 (Sept. 1954) 92-107; « Indous et chrétiens en face du détachement », *Christus* (Paris) n° 9 (1956) 61-80.] [a searching and nuanced analysis of the meaning of non-attachment (detachment, indifference): parallels and contrasts between the *Bhagavad Gîtâ* and the SpEx: I. Doctrine of non-attachment; II. Non-attachment and the purpose of creation; III. Non-attachment and man’s destiny.]

NEWMAN John W., *Disciplines of Attention. Buddhist Insight Meditation, the Ignatian Spiritual Exercises, and Classical Psychoanalysis* (= Asian Thought and Culture 26), New York, Peter Lang, 1996, xii-229 p. [“Three workshops of emotional transformation”. ‘Buddhist’ = Vipassana meditation. On the SpEx see chapters 5 and 6.]

NG Annie Yi Jung Pan, “Ignatius’ *Spiritual Exercises* and Chinese Women’s Spiritual Formation in the Hong Kong Protestant Evangelical Context”, *Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality* 14 / 2 (2014) 187-207. [“Female leaders in Hong Kong are attracted to Ignatian spirituality and attend courses of spiritual formation... In this essay, I aim to investigate the reflections of Western female authors on Ignatius of Loyola *Spiritual Exercises* and consider how these insights might be applied to Protestant Chinese churches.”]

NGUYEN Thao, “Daily examination of consciousness: Ignatian and Vietnamese Truc Lam Zen Approaches to Transformation”, in Elizabeth J. HARRIS & John O’GRADY (eds.), *Meditation in Buddhist-Christian Encounter. A Critical Analysis*, Sankt Ottilien, Eos Verlag, 2019, pp. 421-439. [“a comparative study of the Six-Period Rituals of Repentance developed by... the Vietnamese... Zen tradition and the daily examination of conscience developed by St Ignatius of Loyola”.]

NGUYEN Thi Thanh Thuy, *The Significance of Ignatian Spiritual Discernment for Authentic Moral Discernment: Its Implications for the Religious Sisters in the Vietnamese Congregation of the Lovers of the Cross*, Louvain, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, 2018, xli-235 p. [dissertation.]

*** O’HANLON Daniel J., “Zen and the Spiritual Exercises: A Dialogue Between Faiths”, *Theological Studies* 39 / 4 (1978) 737-768.

O’HANLON Daniel J., “Integration of Christian Practices: A Western Looks East”, *Studies in the Spirituality of Jesuits* 16 / 3 (May 1984) 1-27. [a more autobiographical account; includes a few references to the Sp. Ex.]

PAINADATH Sebastian, “Hinduismo”, in: José GARCÍA de CASTRO (dir.), *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana* (= Colección Manresa 37-38), Bilbao, Mensajero / Santander, Sal Terrae, 2007, pp. 939-942. [“We intend to find out how the spirituality of the SpEx tallies with the spirituality of the *Gîtâ*”: mystical process towards God; God in all things; the spiritual battle; discernment; differences; final evaluation.]

PAINADATH Sebastian, “Gîtâ-Sâdhana: Retreat with the Bhagavad Gîtâ”, Ignis 41 / 1 (2011) 22-29.

PARK Hong, *The Spiritual Exercises of Saint Ignatius as Pedagogy for the Spiritual Formation of Contemporary Korean Catholic Youth*, Rome, Pontificia Università Gregoriana, 1979, 106 p. [excerpta ex diss. ad doctoratum.]

PAS Julian F., *Visions of Sukhâvatî: Shan-tao’s Commentary on Kuan Wu-Liang Shou-Fo Ching*, Albany, State University of New York Press, 1995, pp. 328-332 (+ endnotes p. 406): “Christian and Buddhist Meditation: Amita Inspection versus Ignatian Contemplation”. [the Chinese Pure Land practice of visualization-inspection reaching a climax in the vision of the Buddha Amita is compared and contrasted with the Ignatian contemplation of events in the life of Christ.]

PIDEL Aaron, "Jerome Nadal's *Apologia* for Interreligious Spiritual Exercises and its Contemporary Implications", *Gregorianum* 101 / 4 (2020) 849-869. ["Nadal's *Apologia*... provides a positive yet limited precedent for giving the Spiritual Exercises interreligiously. (...) Nadal's position differs from the strategies proposed in the contemporary Anglophone conversation, as evident in the writings of Reiser, Haight, and Cline." (869)]

PIERIS Aloysius, "Ignatian Exercises Against a Buddhist Background", *The Way Supplement* 68 (Summer 1990) 98-111. [a theology of Ignatian Exercises; 'contemplation' or 'awareness'?; a self without self.] [reprinted in A. PIERIS, *Fire and Water. Basic Issues in Asian Buddhism and Christianity,* Maryknoll, Orbis, 1996, chapter 17.]

PINTO Rolphy, "Three Ways: The Bhagavad Gita and the Spiritual Exercises", *The Way* 61 / 1 (2022) 29-42.

PITHEKAR Joseph M., "*Maun Sadhana*. A Centering Prayer Retreat with Vipassana Exercises and Discipline", *Ignis* 26 / 4 (1997) 14-22. [the SpEx in combination with Vipassana, Centering Prayer, *Maitri Bhavana* (Universal Friendship), and *Maun Sadhana* (discipline of total silence).]

John Pradeep K.: see KANTHARAJ John Pradeep.

*** PUTHIADAM Ignatius & Martin KÄMPCHEN, *Geist der Wahrheit. Christliche Exerzitien im Dialog mit dem Hinduismus. Ein Lese- und Übungsbuch* (= Reihe Engagement), Kevelaer, Butzon & Bercker, 1980, 226 p.

PUTHIADAM Ignatius & S.M. SELVARAJ, *Ignatian Spiritual Exercises in Dialogue with Hinduism and Buddhism. An Eight-Day Retreat*, Bangalore, Asian Trading Corporation, 2006, 219 p.

*** RAGUIN Yves, « Les techniques orientales de méditation et les Exercices de saint Ignace », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignatienne* VII / 28 (oct.-déc. 1983) 227-251.

REDINGTON James D., "A Full Outline for the Presentation on 'Spiritual Discipline and Transformation: Based on the *Spiritual Exercises* of Ignatius Loyola' and some Afterthoughts", *Journal of Vaishnava Studies* 20 / 2 (Spring 2012) 163-170. [to the Vaishnava–Christian Dialogue participants of 2004 + some 2012 Reflections.]

*** REHG William, "Christian Mindfulness: A Path to Finding God in All Things", *Studies in the Spirituality of the Jesuits* 34 / 3 (May 2002) 1-32. [non-objectivated awareness of the present moment.]

REISER William, "The Spiritual Exercises in a Religiously Pluralistic World", *Spiritus: A Journal of Christian Spirituality* 10 / 2 (2010) 135-157. [in the post-modern West.]

ROSARIO Joseph, "Gandhian Themes for Ignatian Exercises", *Ignis* 20 / 3 (1991) 113-121.

RUEDA M.V., « Los Ejercicios espirituales de S. Ignacio y las meditaciones orientales, en especial el Zen », *Reflexiones* (CIRE, Centro Ignaciano de Reflexión y Ejercicios, Bogotá) 1980 / 3, 16-53.

RYAN Patrick J., "Muslim Perspectives on Ignatian Spirituality", in Robert J. DALY & Thomas HUGHSON (eds.), *Ecumenism and Ignatian Spirituality. Proceedings of the 22nd International Congress of Jesuit Ecumenists*, Chestnut Hill, Institute for Advanced Jesuit Studies (Boston College), 2013, pp. 171-193.

SABEL Roland, *Der Gottesbezug als grundlegende Lebensausrichtung. Zugangswege zum 'Prinzip und Fundament' der 'Geistlichen Exerzitien' des Ignatius von Loyola für Menschen am Beginn des 21. Jahrhunderts* (= Pastoralpsychologie und Spiritualität 5), Peter Lang, 2003, 196 p. [In today's multireligious culture, the orientation towards the God of the Christian faith as a foundation for a new quality of life. A pastoral-psychological perspective.]

SALDANHA Vincent, “Profile of the Spiritual Aspirant in the Spiritual Exercises and in the *Advaita Vedânta* of Śankarâcârya”, *Ignis* 49 / 1 (2019) 46-57. [similarities and unique features; dialogue and praxis for mutual enrichment.]

SAMY A.M.A.: see AMA SAMY.

*** SCHEUER Jacques, “The Bhagavad Gîtâ as ‘Spiritual Exercises’” in Catherine CORNILLE (ed.), *Song Divine. Christian Commentaries on the Bhagavad Gîtâ* (= Christian Commentaries on Non-Christian Sacred Texts 1), Leuven, Peeters / Dudley, Eerdmans, 2006, pp. 113-129.

SCHEUER Jacques, « Proposer les Exercices à des non-chrétiens ? », *Christus* n° 259 (juillet 2018) 105-115. [a review of CLINE 2018.]

SCHLÜTER Ana María, “Zen y espiritualidad ignaciana. Aportación al discernimiento desde la perspectiva zen”, *Pasos* (Brihuega, España) n° 120 (invierno 2012) 7-16.

SCHÜTTE Joseph, « Ignatianische Exerzitien im frühchristlichen Japan », *Monumenta Nipponica* 6 (1943) 375-390.

SEKHAR Vincent, “Jaina Spirituality in the Light of the Spiritual Exercises of St Ignatius”, *Ignis* 133 (1992 / 3) 108-113.

SELVARAJ S.M. : see PUTHIADAM Ignatius & S.M. SELVARAJ 2006.

SENÉCAL Bernard, « Zen et Exercices spirituels », *Christus* n° 162 (avril 1994) 226-234. [what is Zen?; a Christian (and Ignatian) perspective.]

*** SENÉCAL Bernard, *Jésus le Christ à la rencontre de Gautama le Bouddha. Identité chrétienne et bouddhisme*, Paris, Cerf, 1998, 252 p.

SENÉCAL Bernard, « Dialogue interreligieux en acte : la méditation comme lieu de rencontre entre bouddhistes et chrétiens », in Paul MAGNIN (dir.), *L’intelligence de la rencontre du bouddhisme. Actes du colloque du 11 octobre 2000 à la Fondation Singer-Polignac* (= Études lubaciennes II), Paris, Cerf, 2001, pp. 143-162.

SENÉCAL Bernard, « Une retraite ‘Zazen – Exercices spirituels’ », *Cahiers de spiritualité ignacienne* 102 (2002) 75-86.

SENÉCAL Bernard, « Zen y Ejercicios Espirituales », in : José GARCÍA de CASTRO (dir.), *Diccionario de Espiritualidad Ignaciana* (= Colección Manresa 37-38), Bilbao, Mensajero / Santander, Sal Terrae, 2007, pp. 1795-1799. [German translation : « Zen und Geistliche Übungen », *Geist und Leben* 85 / 4 (2012) 413-418.]

SENÉCAL Bernard, “Vers une pratique des *kôans* bibliques. Le *Passe sans porte* de l’évangile de Luc. Expérience mystique, responsabilité sociale et globalisation”, *Recherches de Science Religieuse* 96 / 3 (2008) 369-379. [I. Kakichi Kadowaki, pioneer in the development and practice of biblical *kôan*-s; II. The Korean Buddhist tradition of *kôan*-s and the creation of *kôan*-s inspired by the Gospel of Luke; III. The social impact of the practice of Gospel *kôan*-s.]

SENÉCAL Bernard, “Moving beyond the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola (1491-1556)” in VELIATH Cyril (ed.), *The Wheel & the Cross. An Anthology by Jesuits & Friends on Buddhism and Dialogue*, Phnom Penh, MAGGA Jesuit Research Center (on behalf of Jesuit Conference of Asia Pacific), 2021, pp. 73-80 [full text at **https://jcapsj.org/wp-content/uploads/1/2021/12/The-Wheel-The-Cross.pdf**]. [“People who know me well and who also know the Spiritual Exercises, tell me that I remain deeply structured by them. Be that as it may, to me, to be faithful to Ignatius of Loyola and his Spiritual Exercises today, means to have the capability of going beyond them” (80).]

SENÉCAL Bernard: see also CHAMPAGNE 2003.

SHIN Junhyoung Michael, "The Reception of the *Evangelicae historiae imagines* in Late Ming China: Visualizing Holy Topography in Jesuit Spirituality and Pure Land Buddhism", *Sixteenth Century Journal* 40 / 2 (2009) 303-333.

*** SHIPPEE Steven, "Buddhist Generation and Ignatian Contemplation: Skillful Use of the Imagination in Interreligious Contemplative Dialogue", *Dilatato Corde* (**www.dimmid.org**) 8 / 1 (2018) 1-20.

*** SIM Jong-Hyeok Luke, *The Christological Vision of the* Spiritual Exercises *of St. Ignatius of Loyola and the Hermeneutical Principle of Sincerity* (Ch'eng) *in the Confucian Tradition*, Roma, Pontificia Universitas Gregoriana, 1992, xi-311 p. [dissertation]

SOOSAI Lawrence, "The Buddha's Psycho-Spirituality at the Service of Ignatian Spirituality", in VELIATH Cyril (ed.), *The Buddha & Jesus. An anthology of articles by Jesuits engaged in Buddhist Studies and Inter-religious Dialogue*, Kelaniya (Sri Lanka), Tulana Research Centre for Encounter and Dialogue (on behalf of Jesuit Conference of Asia Pacific), 2015, chapter 15 [full text at **https://jcapsj.org/the-buddha-jesus/**].
[A. – Theory: the Buddha's discovery of Universal Human Psychology and its Dynamics, is a great help to grow in self-awareness, self-purification, self-mastery, and spiritual perfection; certain similarities between Buddhist Psycho-Spirituality and Ignatian Christ-centric Spirituality are pointed out. B. – Practice: the Theravâda Mindfulness Exercises enable a person to practice Ignatian Spirituality in many ways more effectively (e.g. Daily particular examination of conscience, General examination of conscience, Contemplation to obtain love, Discernment of spirits).]

STANDAERT Nicolas, "The Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius of Loyola in the China Mission of the 17th and 18th Centuries", *Archivum Historicum Societatis Iesu* 81 / 1 (2012) 73-124. ["This article traces in chronological order the history of the practice of the Ignatian spiritual exercises in China in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. Each part of this period has its corresponding corpus of texts, each reflecting one aspect of the spiritual exercises. (...) To a large extent the evolution in China also reflects the changes in the theory and practice... in Europe." (124)]

*** STANDAERT Nicolas, "Ignatian Visual Meditation in Seventeenth-Century China", in Halvor EIFRING (ed.), *Meditation and Culture. The Interplay of Practice and Context*, London, Bloomsbury, 2015, pp. 24-35 (+ endnotes pp. 218-219). ["Although there are differences between the Buddhist, Daoist, and Ignatian visualization and imagination methods, the reproduction of images and the choice of words made by the Chinese Christians and missionaries to translate the Ignatian method show that it entered into a context in which similar visual meditation practices already existed."]

TAMAYO-MORAGA Sarita, "Buddhist and Ignatian Spiritualities: Reports on a Trial Run of an Interfaith Retreat based on *Ignatius and the Buddha in Conversation: A Resource for a Religiously Plural Dialog Juxtaposing the Spiritual Exercises of Ignatius and Buddhist Wisdom*", *Buddhist-Christian Studies* 37 (2017) 131-143. [highlights of the experienced retreat; the larger context of Buddhist-Christian interfaith retreats.]

TISCHLER Len: see DELBECQ Andre & Len TISCHLER 2015.

TOMLIN Holly, "The Mystical Experiences of Saint Ignatius of Loyola and the Prophet Muhammad", *Ignis* 27 / 3 (1998) 15-26. [the author is a Muslim student at Saint Louis University, U.S.A.]

UGWUANYI Chikere, "Adaptations of the Spiritual Exercises: An Example from Africa", *The Way* 53 / 3 (July 2014) 56-67. ["Africa is a unique spiritual space because there is a cultural disposition for multiple experiences of the divine, and because its geographical wonders make the encounter with the divine awe-filled. How can the dynamics of the

Spiritual Exercises be adapted to this spiritual space and opened up to its people?" (63)]

URMENETA F., « Ascética Javeriana. Reminiscencias de los 'Ejercicios' en las cartas de Javier », *Manresa* 24 (1952) 265-279.

VILLAGRÁN Gonzalo, "An Ignatian Spirituality Approach to Dialogue with Islam", *Gregorianum* 99 / 3 (2018) 579-597. [republished in *Ignaziana* [www.ignaziana.org], numero speciale [2019]: Rossano Zas Friz De Col (ed.), "Prospettive teologiche e filosofiche sulla tradizione ignaziana in *Gregorianum* (2013-2018)", 198-214.] [based in part on the SpEx.]

VOSS ROBERTS Michelle, "Neither Bhukti nor Mukti: The New Sensorium in Devotional Practice." *Practical Matters Journal* (April 1, 2009) **http://practicalmattersjournal.org/?p=1851**. ["The author compares two textual case studies of imaginative devotional practices...: Ignatius of Loyola's Spiritual Exercises and the Bhakti-rasamrta-sindhu, a sixteenth-century text that was foundational for the Gaudiya Vaishnava movement in Bengal. As contributions to a contemporary theological aesthetics, both texts demonstrate that imagination is rooted in bodily experience but reaches beyond these confines toward the transcendent."]

WALDENFELS Hans, "Vom Schweigen des Buddha und den Geistlichen Übungen des Ignatius von Loyola", in SCHLIER Heinrich *et al.* (Hrsg.), *Strukturen christlicher Existenz. Beiträge zur Erneuerung des geistlichen Lebens*, Würzburg, Echter, 1968, pp. 139-151, 381-382. [reprinted in *Faszination des Buddhismus, Zum christlich-buddhistischen Dialog*, Mainz, Matthias-Grünewald, 1982, ch. 7, pp. 112-123.] [points of contact between the 'ways' (*dô*) of Japan, especially *zazen*, and the SpEx; it is urgent to retrieve, in the practice of the SpEx, the importance of method, exercise, body, and silence.]

WALDENFELS Hans, "Unterscheidung der Geister im Bereich christlich-buddhistischer Meditationspraxis", *Stimmen der Zeit* 231 (2013 / 7) 479-491. [translated: "Esercizio Zen e meditazione cristiana", *La Civiltà Cattolica* 4011-4012 (2017 / III) 209-222.]

WHITAKER Justin S., "Reflecting on Meditation's Ethics: Ignatian 'Spiritual Exercises' and Buddhist 'Mettâ-Bhâvanâ'", *Journal of Interreligious Studies* 15 (Fall 2014) pp. 96-107. ["analysis and comparison of the ethical and soteriological nature of two highly distinctive forms of meditation... through examining the imaginative and emotive language employed in these practices and exploring the complex role that meditation plays in the ethics..."] [reprinted in DY Ari C. (ed.) 2019.]

Index

Historical Jottings
ACHARYA 2007
BESSE 1910
DE SMET 1991
HOSTEN 1911
IPARRAGUIRRE 1950, 1955
LECLEIR 2004
LOPETEGUI 1952
MOLINA 2003
NAMJOSHI 2007
SCHÜTTE 1943
STANDAERT 2012, 2015
URMENETA 1952

Hinduism and **Buddhism**
Entries are too many to be listed

Islam
ALÈS (d') 1996
COLOMBO 2014
EDWIN 2003
FENOYL (de) 2018
KÖRNER 2013
MADIGAN 2007
RYAN 2013
TOMLIN 1998
VILLAGRÁN 2018

Jainism
SEKHAR 1992

Judaism
LOMBA 2003
MOORE 1992

African Traditions
MARANDU 2013
UGWUANYI 2014

China / Chinese Traditions
CHANG 1952
CLINE 2018
GREGSON 1974
GUÉRIN 1995-99, 2000
GUEVARA 2012
NG 2014
PAS 1995
SHIN 2009
SIM 1992

Korea
KWON 2019
PARK 1979

Vietnam
NAM 2007
NGUYEN Thao 2019
NGUYEN Thi Thanh Thuy 2018

Tibetan Traditions
HARNACK 1974
SCHIPPEE 2018

Western Pluralist World and/or Sharing the SpEx with non-Christians
AMALADOSS 2013
CLINE 2018
CLOONEY 2002
DELBECQ-TISCHLER 2015
FLÓREZ 1989
GISPERT-SAUCH 2004
HABITO 2013
HAIGHT 2012
MARZAL 1992
NADAL 2004
PIDEL 2020
REISER 2010
SABEL 2003
SCHEUER 2018
TAMAYO-MORAGA 2017